|  | **Responsiveness to the Component** | **Evidence** | **Analysis: Explanation/ Rationale of Assertions Supported by Evidence** | **Overall Judgment** | **Comments**  **See Individual Reviewer Checklists** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1. What does the workforce program do? | Fall 2024  R1 – AWOR |  |  | Fall 2024  Spring 2024  Comp: AWRC  R1 – AWOR | R1  Unclear or omitted information now included:   * Mission statement * Program learning outcomes * Marketable skills * Industry served   Inconsistencies of numeric data in this section and other sections are now corrected. |
| 2. Program relationship to the college mission and strategic plan. | NA | NA | NA | Spring 2024  Comp: AWR | NA |
| 3. Program relationship to student demand. | Fall 2024  R1 – AWRC | Fall 2024  R1 – AWRC | Fall 2024  R1 – AWRC | Fall 2024  Spring 2024  Comp: RR  R1 - AWRC | R1  Information now subtly included:   * applicant acceptance rate * five-year implications   Student support is well-addressed.  Although the text now addresses program enrollment by gender, there is no specific data nor evidence provided to support the claim in the last two sentences, “There has also been an increase in male gender applicants and graduates. This is attributed to highlighting the male graduates from previous years who have been in various public relations and marketing promotions.”  ***There remains within the text no specific engagement with data contained within Appendix F:***   * ***no data or discussion of disproportionality of any demographic (only implied by discussion of gender)*** * ***no comparison with Collin College’s overall student demographic distributions*** * ***no analysis of patterns in enrollment*** * ***no plans to attract a more diverse student population.*** |
| 4. Program relationship to market demand. | Fall 2024  R1 – AWR | Fall 2024  R1 – AWR | Fall 2024  R1 – AWR | Fall 2024  Spring 2024  Comp: AWRC  R1 – AWR | R1  The text now includes:   * The number of program-related jobs available in the DFW Metroplex. * Modified text of standards comparison * Corrections/clarification of data related to graduates and graduates finding employment   There remains no Identification or discussion of the program’s weaknesses related to market demand.  *Recommend addressing the program’s weaknesses related to market demand.*  *This seems a perfect opportunity to set up previous CIP Outcomes by discussing:*   * *the program’s pre-renovation relative competitive weakness with preventive dental sealants compared to recent renovations at Texas A&M Health Science Center in Dallas (and TWU?).* * *how the program learned from the local and/or national dental community that Collin students required improved training and state-of-the-art equipment to gain competency in preventive dental sealants.* |
| 5. How effective is the program’s curriculum? | Fall 2024  R1 – AWOR | Fall 2024  R1 – AWOR | Fall 2024  R1 – AWR | Fall 2024  Spring 2024  Comp: AWRC  R1 – AWR | R1  Although #5A text does not include any data about the following, #**5E does fully address**, and Appendix H includes an example of the most recently completed academic year:   * course-level completion rates * course success rates   Although #5A text does not examine enrollment flow through the program curriculum, #**5C fully addresses** the frequency with which courses are scheduled, and #5E fully addresses student success rates in the curriculum.  *Recommend simply noting in #5A that those specific topics are addressed in those specific subsections.*  The revised text regarding student withdrawal from the program sufficiently addresses the concern about the prior claim, which lacked evidence.  Inconsistencies of numeric data in this section and other sections are now corrected.  #5C now includes a comparison of the curriculum to competing schools, as well as an analysis thereof, inspiring consideration of a change in the order of initial curriculum delivery to better ensure student success.  #5C improved explanations of:   * program alignment with professional association guidelines to achieve accreditation. * curriculum review process.   The text of #5E now includes clarifications, data, and/or analysis of:   * Average class size * Grade distributions * Course success rates * Integration of general education requirements with technical coursework * Student satisfaction   The revised text in #5E regarding student-to-faculty ratios addresses the prior concern about a claim lacking evidence.  Section #5 ends with a longer list of appendices to provide evidence than the initial submission. However, the appendices are still not cross-referenced in the text.  *Recommend parenthetically cross-referencing the various appendices as topics addressed throughout #5.* |
| 6. How well does program communicate? | NA | NA | NA | Spring 2024  Comp: AWR | NA |
| 7. How well are partnership resources built & leveraged? | NA | NA | NA | Spring 2024  Comp: AWOR | NA |
| 8. Are the faculty supported with professional development? | NA | NA | NA | Spring 2024  Comp: AWOR | NA |
| 9. [Optional] Does the program have adequate facilities, equipment and financial resources? |  |  |  |  | NA |
| 10. How have past CIPs contributed to success? | Fall 2024  R1 – AWOR | Fall 2024  R1 – AWRC | Fall 2024  R1 – AWRC | Fall 2024  R1 – AWRC  Spring 2024  Comp: AWRC | R1  The description now more clearly addresses how the program facility expansion and CIP Outcome #2 positively impacted program competencies for CIP Outcome #1.  The description now includes statements about students achieving 100% competency at the laboratory and clinical skills level and a 2023 employer survey revealing new graduate competency in preventive dental sealants.  ***However, it seems that there should be appendices containing evidence to support claims about students achieving 100% competency at the laboratory and clinical skills level and a 2023 employer survey revealing new graduate competency in preventive dental sealants.*** |
| 11. How will program evaluate its success? | Fall 2024  R1 – AWOR | Fall 2024  R1 – AWOR | Fall 2024  R1 – AWOR | Fall 2024  Spring 2024  Comp: RR  R1 – AWOR | R1  The text now provides rationale for the expected outcomes chosen for the CIPs identified in #12. |
| 12. Future Continuous Improvement Plan (CIP) | NA |  |  | Spring 2024  Comp: AWR | NA |

**Overall Decision:**

Accept With Recommendations

**General comments about the submission or rationale for the conclusion:**

Overall, this is a well-considered resubmission that addresses almost every concern raised by the review team. This program is admirable in its commitment to student support and success, as well as community engagement and service.

Nevertheless, there are two subsections of the program review that I regard as requiring changes (i.e., Approve with Required Changes (AWRC)) due to the current program review prompts/questions and my understanding of the expectations of program responsiveness to, evidence for, and analysis of them.

1. Section I - #3: The revised text still does not analyze or otherwise specifically engage with data contained within Appendix D or Appendix F regarding:

* disproportionality of any demographic (except gender)
* comparison with Collin College’s overall student demographic distributions
* analysis of patterns in student demographic enrollment (e.g., a significant decrease of students in the program from one race or ethnicity)
* plans to attract student populations with demographic characteristics that have trended low in program enrollment.

1. Section III - #10: The revised text makes claims about students achieving 100% competency at the laboratory and clinical skills level and a 2023 employer survey revealing new graduate competency in preventive dental sealants but provides no concrete evidence in the text or any appendices in the form of:

* student competencies in the pertinent laboratory and clinical skills before and after renovation
* the 2023 employer survey instrument or results, nor any comparative information about employers or the advisory committee or recent graduates expressing concerns that graduates lacked sufficient competency with preventive dental sealants before the renovations.