UNIT NAME: Math, Science, and Writing Labs	**AUTHORING TEAM CONTACT:** Jennifer Solomon
PHONE: 972.553.1134	**E-MAIL:** jsolomon@collin.edu

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY (COMPLETE THIS SECTION LAST)

Briefly summarize the topics that are addressed in this Service Unit Review, including areas of strengths and areas of concern.

The Anthony Peterson Centers for Academic Assistance, like other student services at Collin College exist to provide "student and community-centered" support. More specifically, the APCAAs provide comprehensive academic support services through tutoring, embedded classroom instruction, and workshop offerings. While the centers' primary stakeholders are the enrolled students at the College's seven physical campuses, the iCollin virtual campus, and dual credit sites across the county, community members are also served on a walk-in basis. Regardless of modality (on-campus or online), APCAA staff strive to prioritize and streamline student access to tutoring services.

The centers along with other student services within the College follow the guidance in relevant sections of SACSCOC's (Southern Association of Colleges and Schools Commission on Colleges) *2024 Principles of Accreditation*. Furthermore, the resources District APCAAs provide align with the strategic goals outlined in *Collin College's Master and Strategic Plans 2020-2025*. Throughout the review period, the unit was particularly focused on the following strategic goals: (1) Improv[ing] student outcomes to meet or exceed local, state, and regional accreditation thresholds and goals, (2) Develop[ing] and implement[ing] strategies to become a national exemplar in program and student outcomes, and creat[ing] and implement[ing] comprehensive integrated pathways to support student transitions. A commitment to these three goals is demonstrated, specifically, and all six goals generally, by data cited in the report.

The cornerstone of a strong service unit is comprehensive communication. The APCAAs showcase effective communication strategies with their stakeholders through a multifaceted approach. By deploying printed material, email communication, classroom visits, information tables, in-center orientations, and other strategies, the unit connects positively with its constituents. Streamlining communication with students was central to the decision to integrate tutoring services using the TracCloud platform. The appointment system allows center staff to send session and center-related information through email or SMS messaging. For their part, community members can access center information through a public-facing Collin.edu website and information sessions, which are often open to the public (e.g.: home-school information nights).

The program review that follows highlights key features of the Anthony Peterson Centers for Academic Assistance (APCAAs), including strengths, opportunities for improvement, and goals for the next 5-year assessment cycle. A summary of those areas of focus is outlined below:

Strengths:

- Offers tutoring in a variety of academic disciplines--math, writing, science, and additional subjects—which varies by campus/online availability.
- Provides resources to supplement tutoring (e.g.: computers, calculators, printers, study spaces, textbooks, microscopes, science models, and other pertinent materials).
- Facilitates embedded in-class and in-center support tutoring for students in developmental and co-requisite courses for both mathematics and reading/writing.
- Maintains a strong communication/promotional strategy with District and community stakeholders.
- Coordinates streamlined services through the implementation of monthly managers' meetings, a District webpage, Canvas course, and a new appointment scheduling platform.

Opportunities for improvement:

- Improvement of online tutoring staffing/scheduling model. (with an understanding that staffing of on-campus centers remains the top priority)
- Strengthening the marketing strategy for students who attend Collin College exclusively online.

As a result of the service unit review process, and reflection on the department's strengths, weaknesses, and opportunities for growth, the APCAA managers have identified the following goals to guide the next assessment cycle: (1): Improve and streamline distribution of information about Districtwide APCAA services to all students, especially those in dual credit and online courses. (2): Managers will create a proposal based on gathered data that will recommend an appropriate level of online staffing and management that would lead to greater online appointment availability. These goals will further streamline constituents' experience and allow APCAA managers to continue to deliver high-quality, professional tutoring services during the next review period.

I. UNIT AND ITS CONTEXT

A. Describe the unit, its relationship to the college, and the community it serves.

The Anthony Peterson Center for Academic Assistance (APCAA) exists to support learning and academic excellence at Collin College and in the community it serves. In a welcoming, respectful environment, the APCAA provides free learning support to Collin College students, faculty, staff, and Collin County community members that empowers students to be independent thinkers and enhances the acquisition of skills students need to succeed in courses across the curriculum and beyond. This objective is in alignment with the college's mission to be "a student and community-centered

institution committed to developing valuable skills . . . and challenging intellect." While serving a broad range of people with learning support, the APCAA prioritizes current Collin College student support for enrolled courses through the availability of appointments for in-person and online services.

With the expansion of District campuses, the APCAA now includes locations at seven campuses as well as Districtwide online services. Services include professional tutoring in a variety of delivery methods, including one-on-one appointments, walk-in tutoring, group tutoring, embedded tutoring in classrooms during regularly scheduled class meeting times, and online services. Tutoring is available in a broad range of subjects like writing, reading, math, and science, which build skills applicable across the curriculum, as well as in content-specific courses like chemistry, biology, accounting, economics, and history. The APCAA also assists students with college readiness and TSI tutoring support. In addition to tutoring, the APCAA provides workshops, seminars, exam reviews, computer access, printing, study materials like science models, microscopes, and resource books, and study spaces for independent or group study.

The APCAA also partners with other college departments to provide a network of support for students so that students have a comprehensive experience. APCAA staff frequently refer students to other departments for additional assistance, like the library and counseling services, to promote holistic student success beyond the specific academic services the APCAA provides.

   B. **Describe the following points as applicable:**

   1. **Unit's purpose**

The purpose of the APCAA is to provide students and community members a variety of free services to support their academic goals. The APCAA provides academic support in a wide variety of specific subjects as well as support for math and writing skills required across the College's coursework. The APCAA also offers support related to personal effectiveness strategies such as time management and study skills and opportunities for connection and engagement through learning events and writing contests. These supports are available to community members on a limited, walk-in basis in order to prioritize student support.

With the rapid expansion of the Collin College district from 2020-2022, APCAAs are now located at seven district campuses as well as online:
   - Allen Technical Campus (Room A280)
   - Farmersville Campus (Room 120)
   - Celina Campus (Library Room 002)
   - Frisco Campus (Founders Hall 148, Lawler Hall 141, Lawler Hall 202)
   - McKinney Campus (Room C119)
   - Plano Campus (Room D203)
   - Wylie Campus (Room WLB217)

- Districtwide Online Tutoring

In order to support the diverse scheduling needs of Collin's student population, the APCAAs provide daytime, evening, and weekend availability in person. During fall and spring semesters, APCAA campus locations, collectively, are open Monday-Thursday between 9am and 8pm, Fridays between 9am and 5pm, and Saturdays between 9am and 5pm. Online services can be accessed seven days a week, generally between 9am and 9pm. Hours are slightly reduced during summer, winter, and May semesters. Supplementary online support is also available on a limited basis through NetTutor, especially course content for which the APCAA has less staff tutor availability.

If unit has a purpose/mission statement, upload it in section I.B.1. of the Appendix.

2. **Services and products unit provides**

The comprehensive variety of academic assistance and resources provided by the APCAA includes:
- Professional tutoring for a variety of subjects in a broad range of formats, including one-on-one appointments, walk-in tutoring, group tutoring, embedded tutoring, online appointments (all synchronous)
- Workshops and seminars, and final exam reviews, offered by staff and faculty volunteers
- Writing feedback on resumes, cover letters, and essays for applications or scholarships
- Computers with access to the internet, college resources, MS office suite, and software used in courses
- Printing
- Science models, materials, microscopes, and slides
- Study materials, including textbooks, style guides, resource books, topic-specific handouts and PowerPoints, and dry erase boards
- Graphing calculators
- Safe, welcoming, open-seating study areas for individual and group study. Study rooms are available for reservation at some APCAAs.
- Special event and contest opportunities, including short story and poetry contests, NaNoWriMo events and contest, writing summer camp (Wylie), and cosponsored events with other Collin departments like libraries, career centers, and counseling services

3. **Constituents unit serves**

The APCAA serves a wide range of constituents: students, faculty, staff, prospective students, and Collin County community members.

The primary constituents the APCAA serves are current Collin College students. The APCAA prioritizes current Collin College student support by providing first choice for appointments through the ability to schedule appointments ahead of time, both in-person and online. Community members are able to schedule same-day appointments only. These appointments allow students to reserve convenient meeting times with tutors. The APCAA also offers walk-in tutoring services that require no advance notice or reservation, which is another convenient way for students to engage with tutors. In order to meet the needs of the diverse student and Collin county community population, the APCAA has also expanded service offerings to include a wider range of subjects as well as hours of availability and modes of delivery. Online tutoring is available seven days per week, including hours into the evening, which allows broader schedule accommodation for iCollin (Web) students, evening and weekend college students, students with children, and dual credit students.

The APCAA supports faculty with embedded tutors for in class support, opportunities for service through volunteer tutoring hours, office hour, seminar, and exam review meeting spaces, workshops presented by APCAA staff, and committee involvement. The APCAA also supports college staff from other departments through collaboration on and cross-promotion of shared-interest projects and initiatives.

The APCAA serves prospective students through college readiness support on a walk-in basis, especially in areas of math, reading, and writing and for assessments like the TSI. Another way the APCAA serves prospective students is as part of the recruitment process; recruiters are able to assure them that academic support is available by showing these students the APCAA services, thereby encouraging these students to register for courses they may find intimidating.

4. **Regulatory standards unit must meet, if applicable**

Like all Collin College academic and student services, the APCAA is governed by relevant sections of SACSCOC's (Southern Association of Colleges and Schools Commission on Colleges) 2024 Principles of Accreditation. SACS principles relevant to the APCAA and all Collin academic and student services are provided below:

> SECTION 12: Academic and Student Support Services
> Student success is significantly affected by the learning environment. An effective institution provides appropriate academic and student support programs and services, consistent with the institution's mission, that enhance the educational and personal development experience(s) of students at all levels; contribute to the achievement of teaching and learning outcomes; ensure student success in meeting the goals of the educational programs; and provide an appropriate range of support services and programs to students at all locations. Qualified and effective faculty and staff are essential to implementing the institution's goals and mission and to ensuring the quality and integrity of its academic

and student support programs and services. An effective institution has policies and procedures that support a stimulating and safe learning environment..

> 1. The institution provides appropriate academic and student support programs, services, and activities consistent with its mission. (Student support services) [CR]
> 2. The institution ensures an adequate number of academic and student support services staff with appropriate education or experience in student support service areas to accomplish the mission of the institution. (Student support services staff)

As noted, the purpose of the APCAA is to offer students a variety of free academic support services and resources to augment their academic success. This support is consistent with the College's mission: "Collin County Community College District is a student and community centered institution committed to developing skills, strengthening character, and challenging the intellect." In order to develop skills, students are provided instruction in the classroom, reinforced by additional support from the APCAA.

The APCAA provides a wide range of programs, services, and activities, including support for math and writing skills required across the College's coursework, as well as other subject-specific tutoring. Assistance is offered in both face-to-face and online formats to accommodate the maximum number of students. The service unit also offers seminars focusing on topics like time-management and study skills, consistent with the College's mission of developing skills and strengthening character.

The APCAA is staffed by approximately 150-160 academic, administrative, and student assistant support services staff across the district, each with appropriate education or experience. Hiring practices across the district are consistent with college established minimum education and experience requirements. Support from the APCAA is available every day of the week, during evening and weekend hours, on-site (except on Sundays) and online, to serve all students and community members.

II.   UNIT RELATIONSHIP TO COLLEGE MISSION AND STRATEGIC PLAN

A. **Explain with unit-specific evidence how the unit supports the College's mission statement: "Collin County Community College District is a student and community-centered institution committed to developing skills, strengthening character, and challenging the intellect."**

To echo Part I of the service unit review, the Anthony Peterson Centers for Academic Assistance['s] "primary role is to assist Collin College students with their coursework for their enrolled classes." Additionally, the centers provide community-centered assistance through TSI and GED preparation. Community members may also access the center on a walk-in basis for guidance with the math and writing sections of these and other placement exams, as well as personal, non-course related writing projects. Additionally, the centers provide assistance with career documents, such as resumes and cover letters. The centers' tutoring services, utilized by both students and Collin County residents, create a consistent and professional avenue for fulfilling the mission of the college.

Often, aiding students in "developing skills" means first guiding students in mastering new technology to access educational services. During this assessment cycle, APCAA managers were asked to find and implement a scheduling system that made the process of scheduling tutoring more dynamic and streamlined. After multiple meetings with software companies, TracCloud was chosen. While there have been some stumbling blocks with implementation and consistency of service, the platform does provide standardization of user experience and a more seamless sign-in process between campuses and tutoring services. As with any new system or initiative, many of the first months of implementation were spent learning about TracCloud and facilitating a positive, more automated user experience. For example, TracCloud allows center managers to operate a Districtwide, synchronous, online schedule via integration with Zoom. This makes assistance for all students accessible seven days a week. The appointment platform fulfills the college's mission by making tutoring services accessible and standardized for students Districtwide. At the nexus of the unit is the tutoring and academic support that is facilitated by subject matter experts. Seeking tutoring outside of the classroom hones basic skills, supports course learning objectives, and ultimately improves completion rates, as evidenced by the data collected for this unit review.

In addition to sharpening skills through tutoring services, the APCAAs also seek to strengthen college-level skills by providing on-campus, online, and in-class workshops at the majority of our locations. These informational, free-of-charge sessions offer instruction in topics such as MLA formatting, using the TI-84 calculator, writing lab reports, and many other pertinent subjects. The robust variety of workshops supplement faculty instruction, thereby bolstering the mission of the College.

The centers' alignment with "developing skills" and "challenging the intellect" is also demonstrated through the inquiries posed in the nightly student satisfaction surveys. These post-session tools are deployed to measure student experience of, and satisfaction with, tutoring. In the Fall of 2021, APCAA managers worked together to establish consistency in survey questions. Specifically, question eight sought to gauge student engagement with their own learning. The question reads, "Please describe one writing, math, science, or study strategy you learned during your session today?" Ultimately, this question enables the unit to measure skill development and engagement with intellect. For the survey period of Fall 2020 to Summer 2023, the percentage of students districtwide who provided an answer to this

question was 77%. The published goal for this outcome was 70%. The majority of the responses were substantive and showcased students' potential for self-reflection and metacognition. Such data indicates that Collin College APCAAs are succeeding in fulfilling Collin College's mission of "developing skills and challenging the intellect."

While students' own words are largely positive and qualitatively significant, the unit's relationship to the larger mission is also borne out in numerical data. Along with survey responses, the second CIP outcome measured course completion rates (defined as course completion with a C or higher) among students who used Writing Center and Math Lab services as compared to students who did not use center services. Using ZogoTech, APCAA managers examined course completion rates for INRW 0405, INRW 0315, and ENGL 1301 courses. According to the Findings section of the CIP 4-year report, "during Fall 2022, Spring 2023, and Fall 2023, course completion rates with a grade of C or higher for ENGL 1301, INRW 0315, and INRW 0405 courses were higher among students who had attended two or more Writing Center tutoring appointments compared to students who did not attend any tutoring appointments during that semester."

Similarly, among students who took math courses, appointments with tutoring services yielded positive completion rates. During the aforementioned semesters, course completion rates were higher for enrollees in MATH 0405, MATH 1314, MATH 1324, and MATH 1342 who attended at least two Math Lab tutoring sessions compared to those who did not attend tutoring sessions. While many factors contribute to student completion and success, it can be noted that the APCAAs did positively contribute to students' course completion.

In addition to "developing skills" and "challenging the intellect" completing coursework does much to "strengthen character," as does the mastery of skills, such as writing and mathematical understanding. Ultimately, engaging in tutoring also cultivates self-confidence. The APCAAs also maintain a commitment to investing in students' character, which is demonstrated by offering workshops and other programming that emphasizes the mastery of concepts such as avoiding plagiarism, understanding academic integrity, and engaging in the responsible use of AI tools like ChatGPT. The majority of the seven brick-and-mortar campuses and online services offer workshops and/or classroom-based information sessions on academic integrity and related concepts.

Ultimately, while positive trends for course success, completion and streamlining tutoring access do not indicate causation, it does establish the Anthony Peterson Centers for Academic Assistance as catalysts that promote the college's mission.

B. **Explain with unit-specific evidence how the unit supports the College's strategic plan (2020–2025 Strategic Plan).**

The Anthony Peterson Centers for Academic Assistance work in tandem with a network of student support services to facilitate the college's strategic goals during the 2020-2025 period. Over the course of the review period, the District APCAAs have made strides in meeting the targets in the college's recent strategic plan. A breakdown of the service unit's progress towards these goals is detailed below:

Goal #1: Improve Student Outcomes to Meet or Exceed Local, State, and Regional Accreditation Thresholds and Goals

Improvement in student outcomes is evident based on the tracking of the course completion rate and success rate that was traced in specific INRW, ENGL, and MATH courses between Fall 2022 and Fall 2023. As extrapolated in the 4-year report, over each long semester the percentage of students who completed INRW0405, INRW 0315, and ENGL 1301 was higher when compared to students who did not attend a Writing Center session. (Please see the 4-year for specific percentages and note that completion rate of C or higher is labeled as "Success Rate" in all cases).

In Math courses, while the completion rate numbers were not as high, generally settling in 60-70% range, as compared to the 80-90% range in English courses, even still completion rates were higher among Math students who attended two or more Math Lab sessions. While it would be irresponsible to wholly attribute increased completion and success rates to tutoring services alone, it is possible to see a positive relationship between students utilizing tutoring services and completion and persistence rates addressed in the strategic plan.

Goal #2: Develop and Implement Strategies to Become a National Exemplar in Program and Student Outcomes

As referenced in Part 10 of the Service Unit Report, the APCAAs have self-identified many specific strengths. Ultimately, these strengths are strategies that we have found work to draw students and other stakeholders to our centers. The primary strategy used to improve student outcomes is offering a wide variety of tutoring in multiple subjects. In addition to math, science, and writing tutoring, many APCAA locations also offer subject tutoring in disciplines like accounting and economics, and more. Moreover, in Fall of 2021, APCAAs housed at the larger campuses (Frisco, McKinney, Plano, and Wylie) received funds to implement the FAST (Foundational Academic Success Tutoring) program. This model of supplemental instruction provides tutoring and embedded classroom instruction for students in INRW and INRW/ENGL1301 co-requisite courses, as well as developmental mathematics and other paired math co-requisite courses, such as MATH 0405 and MATH0314/MATH 1314, respectively. As evidenced by the aforementioned completion and success rates, it can be deduced that APCAA tutoring and programing appears to contribute to positive student outcomes.

Along with the different modalities of tutoring services, (in-person and online) the APCAAs also provide a variety of outreach through workshops and seminars, class visits, and information tables. By offering a wide variety of services and meeting students and other stakeholders where they are in the district and community, Collin APCAAs are able to contribute to positive outcomes for all constituents.

Goal #3: Create and Implement Comprehensive Integrated Pathways to Support Student Transitions

Collin College's 2020-2025 Strategic Plan defines integrated pathways as ". . . students who successfully complete transitions into Collin College" and "students who successfully complete transitions from Collin College." The district APCAAs facilitate the matriculation and transitions of students in multiple ways. One pathway that leads students into and out of Collin College is the burgeoning dual credit population. This number continues to grow with each new semester, as dual credit offerings expand throughout the District. Dual credit and traditional students alike, benefit from academic support in core, general education courses. Thus, it follows that the APCAAs facilitate student success, thereby, helping students who wish to transfer to 4-year institutions. The centers also support transitions to four-year universities and the workforce through the tutoring of basic mathematics in the Math Labs and assistance with transfer applications and essays, as well as cover letters and resumes in the Writing Centers. For example, the Frisco and Technical Campus writing centers have partnered with the career centers to offer resume review programs.

Goal #4: Implement the Third Baccalaureate Degree by Fall 2022 and Continue Adding 2+2 Programs with University Partners

This goal does not apply to the service unit at this time.

Goal #5: Develop and Implement a Comprehensive Staffing and Succession Model

In an effort to streamline onboarding and enhance communication of center policies and procedures, in 2022 the APCAA *Tutor Handbook* and *Student Assistant Handbook* were created. Throughout the reporting period, the document has been updated to reflect the most current information regarding tutoring and college policies. This contributes to the strategic goal as it maintains uniform standards for all personnel regardless of campus. With the creation and maintenance of the handbooks, students and other stakeholders should expect and will receive consistency of service across the district. To this end, center managers have also created a dynamic shared drive that contains professional development materials. Once complete, although all tutoring staff are degreed professionals, such a repository will allow all employees, but especially new tutors, the opportunity to hone their skills and refresh their knowledge base.

The centers' commitment to succession planning and comprehensive staffing is seen by the unit's history of promoting from within its pool of part-time staff. For example, six of the ten current APCAA managers were former part or full-time Collin College staff members. Additionally, the majority of current APCAA full-time lab instructors and tutors began as part-time instructors or tutors. The ability to retain and promote employees at a high level is indicative of the APCAAs adherence to the College's mission and dedication to its students and stakeholders.

Goal #6: Develop a Coordinated and Systematic Approach to Engage External Stakeholders

As it has since its inception, The Anthony Peterson Centers for Academic Assistance committed to maintain robust relationships with external stakeholders. This is evident in APCAA participation in campus-wide, community-driven events like the Blooming Harvest event at the Farmersville Campus and Shamrock Fest at the Wylie campus. The centers also foster community relationships by hosting events such as the annual Frisco NaNoWriMo activities, as well as a creative writing summer camp organized and overseen by the Wylie Campus APCAA manager and tutoring staff.

These events are in addition to student and parent outreach performed on a yearly basis through events like information tables, dual credit orientations, and homeschool information nights. As a unit the APCAAs understand and respect their role as stewards of education and community involvement.

III.   NECESSITY OF UNIT'S PRIMARY FUNCTIONS OR SERVICES

A. Describe with evidence that the unit's <u>primary</u> functions or services are necessary as they are, should be modified, or should be eliminated.

Described below.

1.   What are the purpose and reason for the services?

The purpose of the APCAAA is to support students' pursuit of their academic goals by providing services and resources that bolster the skills needed to succeed in courses across the curriculum. APCAA resources and services are also available to the community on a limited basis. A primary reason for the APCAA services is to extend the amount of in-depth, one-on-one, and just-in-time learning support available to students. While faculty members support students both in and outside the classroom, through office hours and individual appointments, faculty are unable to provide a high number of contact hours to each individual student. The APCAAs, therefore, augment classroom instruction through services and access to content that support student mastery of skills and academic success. APCAA services also facilitate expanded in-class learning opportunities through embedded tutoring.

Over the past four years, there has been an increase in the need for academic support services at Collin College. According to Collin College Testing Center internal data, there has been an increase in the percentage of students taking the TSI assessment at Collin College who received a "no placement" result since 2021. Also among those who took the TSI assessment at Collin during the same timeframe, consistently more than 57% test takers received a placement into developmental or corequisite math classes and more than 64% of assessment takers received a placement into developmental or corequisite writing classes. While this data does not reflect information regarding those students who receive full or partial exemption from the TSI assessment through other means, it does show that the majority of the thousands of students who take the TSI assessment at Collin each year receive scores indicating skills that do not meet college readiness requirements.

Additionally, the incoming students are less prepared for college since the COVID pandemic. According to a study by Paul A. Westrick, et al., published by College Board in July 2024, "Previous research has found that ACT scores have declined in recent years as have National Assessment of Educational Progress scores since the pandemic. Conversely, HSGPA [high school grade point average] has trended upwards, even despite downward trends in attendance. The results of this study revealed similar trends across nearly every participating institution. We found that the unstandardized or more flexibly assigned measures in this study, HSGPA and often FYGPA [first-year college grade point average], had trended in the opposite direction of our standardized measures, the SAT and PSAT/NMSQT. This somewhat puzzling phenomenon led us to survey faculty members to better understand how student readiness for college has changed (or not) in recent years" (p. 23). The authors found that "the majority of respondents in the faculty survey reported that their incoming students were less prepared than the students they had taught in recent past" (p. 31). The faculty also descrive their students' "characteristics" and "academic performance in college" as "weaker now than in the past" (p. 32). These findings indicate that incoming

college students are less prepared for rigorous college courses and need additional academic support.

With the launch of the iCollin Virtual Campus, there has also been an expansion of web courses offered through Collin College, and students who stuggle with using technology and online learning need additional support, both in person and online, to be successful in these courses. There are also historically-recognized courses that prove challenging for students that can interfere with their ability to complete degrees or certificates (e.g. college algebra) or to maintain competitive gradepoint averages needed to transfer into rigorous programs or universities (e.g. chemistry, biology, calculus, and physics).

2. **How has the unit evolved during the 5-year cycle? How have the reasons for services changed over time?**

Since the last review cycle, managers who are connected to APCAA services have met regularly (typically on a monthly basis) to discuss challenges, collaborative efforts, and progress on CIP goals and outcomes. This has led to more cohesion and collaboration across the District for APCAA management, services, and student experiences. One example of this is collaboration to create more consistent training materials for staff, including a tutor orientation manual and student assistant handbook.

One major discovery of the previous CIP was the need for more streamlined service access and staff training across District APCAAs. During this review cycle, the APCAA managers collaborated across the district to achieve more centralized points of reference for receiving academic assistance through the continued development of the APCAAs identity, physical and digital environments, and marketing. This has contributed to broader awareness of the kinds of services available at each location and throughout the district as well as how to access those services, both for students who visit the physical Center locations as well as faculty engagement and awareness across disciplines. The APCAA managers have also created and maintained up-to-date tutor orientation manuals and student assistant handbooks to facilitate consistency of staff training, processes, and policies throughout the district and to facilitate a consistent experience for students utilizing services at multiple campus locations.

With the Collin College campuses that opened from 2020-2022, the APCAA now includes center locations at the Celina, Farmersville, Allen Technical, and Wylie campuses, adding to the historic locations in Frisco, Plano, and McKinney. In addition to opening new campus locations, the McKinney campus APCAA moved center operations from three separate tutor spaces to one combined tutoring space. The Frisco Writing Center also expanded their center to include a study lounge and workshop room. At the McKinney and Plano campuses, the Science Dens located in library study rooms were incorporated into the APCAA tutoring spaces to provide a higher level of oversight and support for students using these study materials. These moves have also enabled faculty volunteers and staff tutors to better utilize these materials during tutoring sessions.

Another major evolution during this review cycle was the transition to the TracCloud scheduling and recordkeeping system from other attendance tracking systems (MS Access, WCOnline, and Accudemia). In 2021, Collin technology and the APCAA managers determined that previously used systems would not meet the college's needs going forward, specifically with security and Districtwide services utilization and reporting. So, in 2021 and 2022, the APCAA managers collaborated to review and evaluate several platforms in order to select a new one that would meet the scheduling, recordkeeping, and reporting needs across the District APCAAs. TracCloud was selected during this process and was launched at the Collin College APCAAs in August 2022. TracCloud integrates with Banner and Workday, so that student data is directly imported, eliminating the need for students to create an account themselves to utilize the APCAA. The implementation of this shared system has led to the centralization of schedules and data that had not been possible previously, and it has improved the APCAA staffs' ability to assist students receiving services across the District, including online. TracCloud also allows APCAA managers to more easily maximize scheduling between online and on-campus student demand.

New and expanded services since the last review cycle include:

- Increased amount and variety of online tutoring available
- Providing on-site writing tutoring at The Colony High School to support dual credit enrollment and the collegiate academy
- Creation of the APCAA Canvas course, piloted with online students and now available to all Collin College students through self-enrollment
- APCAA webpage redesign—first to initially streamline communication, then a second redesign as part of the Districtwide platform change to modernize the Collin College website
- Faculty referral system (SAGE) launched through TracCloud in fall 2024, which allows faculty to inform the APCAA managers about students who would benefit from APCAA services so that managers can reach out to those students
- The addition of APCAA sponsored events, including NaNoWriMo, creative writing competitions, mindfulness seminars, and stress-free week events
- Developmental Education support expansion—combination of embedded tutoring initiatives of the writing centers/APCAAs and the former SI/T math program through the developmental math faculty, largely staffed by former Accelerated Individualized Mathematics (AIM) instructors. These AIM instructors were reorganized to report to APCAA managers and developmental education specific tutoring became known as the Foundational Academic Success Tutoring (FAST) program offered through the APCAAS.

3. **What would happen if the unit no longer provided the services and/or the services were outsourced?**

The discontinuation and/or outsourcing of the APCAA services and resources would negatively impact student success and is not recommended.

As previously discussed, the APCAA resources and services exist to support students in reaching their academic goals. Personal, hands-on support from cross-trained professional tutoring staff who are familiar with college standards and faculty expectations as well as readily available physical resources like style manuals and textbooks support student success by supplementing the individual support provided by faculty. Student survey data, as evidenced in the APCAAs 4-year report of this CIP cycle, indicates that students almost always feel more confident about the course material they sought help with, can regularly identify study skills or topics learned, and report being satisfied or highly satisfied with the services received. Evidence gathered during this review cycle about the impact of center services on student outcomes also shows a correlation between participation in the tutoring provided through the APCAAs and higher than average student course completion and success rates. The elimination of the workshops and seminars offered by the APCAA would also reduce the number of opportunities available to students who need to acquire required lab credits for their ENGL courses.

While students can receive extra support from faculty members through office hours and individual appointments, the APCAAs extend and supplement the amount of individual support available to students beyond what faculty can provide. The APCAAs help ensure each student can access the amount of extra support needed to reach their academic goals and support the college in meeting institutional academic achievement goals and national benchmarks.

Currently, the APCAAs outsource some online tutoring services through NetTutor to provide student support outside of APCAA operating hours (9 PM-9 AM) and in subjects for which tutoring directly through the APCAA is limited. While NetTutor is a viable option for extending the amount and hours available for core types of tutoring through an online platform, Collin College students overwhelmingly attend math tutoring and science tutoring in person, as compared to online tutoring, even with the increase in the number of online math classes being offered. During the spring 2024 semester, the APCAA recorded 7,502 in-person math and science tutoring related visits; online tutoring for math and science recorded 483 visits that same semester. Writing tutoring attendance records also indicate a strong preference for in-person services, though data shows more demand for online writing tutoring than for tutoring in other subjects. Again, during the spring 2024 semester, the APCAA recorded 8,158 in-person writing tutoring visits; online tutoring for writing recorded 1,821 visits that same semester.

Beyond student preference for in-person tutoring, additional outsourcing raises concerns about ensuring quality of personnel and the ability to respond to student need quickly and efficiently, especially for those students who struggle with using technology. The current hiring process allows assessment and screening to ensure APCAA staff are highly-qualified to provide the most effective support to students. These hiring processes also help ensure compliance with SACSCOC standards. Once onboarded, Collin college APCAA staff are trained in effective student support strategies, customer service strategies, and topics unique to Collin College, such as Dean of Students and SOBI processes. Available APCAA staff can be scheduled and rescheduled according to patterns of student need, even mid way through the semester, if needed. Outsourcing tutoring services could hinder the Colleges' ability to screen and recruit highly-qualified personnel, to ensure their preparation and provide the best service, and would decrease the APCAA's flexibility to schedule dynamically in response to changing patterns of student need. Outsourced tutoring would also create a lack of integration with other college services and a break in communication between tutors and faculty about expectations and student need. Additionally, lack of available on-site support could also lead students to seek private tutoring services, which can be expensive and place an unnecessary financial burden on the student.

In addition to providing academic support, the APCAA also provides a physical space for students to study and access resources, all while contributing to the College's goal of providing a welcoming environment for both students and community members. The APCAAs provide computer software and hardware, as well as calculators, textbooks, and other resources for learning that an outsourced online support service would not provide. Extensive outsourcing could eliminate the APCAAs' physical space and, by extension, student access to these resources. Moreover, the reduction of physical APCAA space could eliminate possible locations for hosting the many seminars and workshops that are offered as well. All of this would work against Collin's goals to support student success in a welcoming environment.

An article by Jill Barshay published by Hechinger Report in October, 2023, states that online "on-demand tutoring relies on students to seek extra help.Very few do. Some school systems have reported usage rates below two percent. A study by researchers at Brown University of an effort to boost usage among 7,000 students at a California charter school network found that students who needed help were the least likely to try online tutoring and only a very small percentage of students used it regularly." Barshay also reported that another research project at Brown University through the Annenberg Center indicated "opt-in tutoring could 'exacerbate inequalities rather than reduce them.'" This seems likely considering there are students who have limited access to technology devices and internet services directly in their homes, creating a clear equality barrier in using online, on-demand tutoring service options. Barshay also asserts that while "on-demand tutoring can appear to be an economical option. . . . once you factor in actual usage, the economics of on-demand tutoring looks less impressive. In Fairfax County, Virginia, for example, only 1.6 percent of students used Tutor.com." While this article is about K-12 education and tutoring, it is reasonable to suppose that similar trends would exist at the college level.

In summary, this review body does not recommend increased outsourcing of APCAA services because of the variety of potential negative impacts on students and on the overall accomplishment of Collin College's mission and goals.

4. **Which unit services require the most resources, including staff time? Which services add the biggest value to the college? If the services that require the most resources are different from the services that add the biggest value to the college, discuss the discrepancy.**

The APCAA service that requires the most financial and time-related resources is the professional tutoring support offered in the various subjects, both by appointment and by walk-in. For the 2023-2024 academic year, a total of 46,325 visits were recorded in TracCloud across District APCAAs. Notably, 23,383 of those visits, or just over 50%, were tutoring appointments alone, not including the other tutoring services available (i.e. walk-in, embedded). Yet, many of the non-tutoring visits could still be correlated to tutoring services. For example, if a student comes into an APCAA for tutoring, they may be more likely to return for independent study or to use other APCAA resources. The largest budget line for APCAAs is salaries for full-time and part-time staff, which includes combinations of lab instructors and professional tutors, almost all of whom have bachelor's or advanced degrees. Tutoring is also the most time-consuming service for staff, not only because of the large number of hours tutors spend directly assisting students, but also because of the amount of time administrative support staff spend helping students connect with tutors and the time managers spend coordinating tutoring schedules and covering tutor leave time. However, this service is also the most valuable to students. Through tutoring sessions, students receive the individualized learning support they need to reach their academic goals, which enables the institution to fulfill its mission and attain its institutional academic success goals. Additionally, many non-tutoring services that students use also require tutors' time, including workshops, class visits, and answering other student questions.

Some evidence of the value of these tutoring appointments can be gleaned from the data that was gathered and examined as part of the APCAA's four-year report submitted in 2024. During the Fall 2022, Spring 2023, and Fall 2023 semesters, course completion rates with a grade of C or higher for ENGL 1301, INRW 0315, and INRW 0405 courses were higher among students who had attended two or more Writing Center tutoring appointments compared to students who did not attend any tutoring appointments during that semester. Additionally, during these same three semesters, the course completion rates with a grade of C or higher for MATH 1314, MATH 1324, MATH 1342, and MATH 0405 courses were higher among students who attended two or more Math Lab tutoring appointments compared to students who did not attend any tutoring appointments during that semester. Although it is not possible to say that attending tutoring appointments directly caused this increase in completion rate, this data does indicate a positive correlation between tutoring appointment attendance and course persistence and success across these three semesters. Additionally, as seen in the four-year report, 77% of survey respondents were able to articulate a strategy they learned during their tutoring appointment on their post-appointment survey between Fall 2020 and Summer 2023. (Please see the complete four-year report in the Appendix document for additional information on this data).

Evidence of the value of tutoring appointments can also be seen in responses to other questions included in the post-appointment surveys sent to students. Below are some sample responses received across different campuses during the 2023-2024 academic year.

> "The available tools and staff were excellent."
> "Yes, this is helping so much!"
> "I am extremely satisfied with my work at the writing center. I feel more prepared for my assignment. Overall, this experience has helped me as a student."
> "It was a great experience! I will be back to get help on future assignments! I am very excited about this opportunity for support."

"I liked how the person who helped me didn't just tell me what to do. He showed me why it was the proper equation and how to understand when to use it."

"I am satisfied. I have always received the guidance and assistance that I needed."

"I loved the service I've gotten today and in the past. No suggestions, but these tutors consistently help me with more than just my essays. I'm always motivated to continue my work after my meetings."

"she helped me gain the knowledge to do the rest of the similar problems on the assignment, and gave me recommendations to help me with the homework"

"Yes, I was satisfied with my tutoring session and learned a few strategies that might help me with my TSI and made me feel a little more confident about the TSI Reading and Writing portion."

"[The tutor] helped me with acquiring the knowledge to figure out the problem on my own. He slows down the learning experience where I can actually understand it."

Secondarily, another significant cost to the APCAAs in the form of maintenance on an established resource is facilities space and upkeep of center equipment, both of which are necessary for tutoring services to take place as well as to offer independent study resource services. Students gain significant value from the availability of whiteboards and a focused study environment, with support staff available if needed to answer questions. Each campus has limited space available for resources, but the investment in assigning and maintaining these spaces is important to the adequate functioning of the APCAA. As demand for tutoring continues to increase, the APCAAs will eventually encounter capacity issues that could negatively impact services. Additionally, with the incorporation of the Science Dens into the APCAAs, some space had to be reassigned for models, microscopes, and other equipment. These pieces of equipment are regularly used by students and faculty, incurring heavy use ahead of science lab practical exams.

Lastly, workshops require varying amounts of time to coordinate, prepare, market, and present. However, this service helps support general student learning in an engaging, hospitable group environment that cannot be attained as easily through other means; it also creates an opportunity for students to earn lab credits for courses that require them.

5. **Describe the unit's lines of communication with other units involved in or supporting each of these services. If any of these lines are not clear, explain why.**

The APCAA maintains several different lines of communication to various stakeholders involved in supporting and utilizing APCAA services. Email and use of the various digital College pages and platforms are the main medium the APCAAs use to communicate with stakeholders. However, it is important to note that APCAAs are not allowed to send mass distribution emails directly to students.

One key line of communication in support of APCAA services is between campus APCAA managers. While the APCAA operates in a coordinated manner across the district to provide students with relatively consistent experiences, each center is managed separately, and managers report to academic deans at their respective campuses. In addition to monthly meetings, managers email with one another frequently and host Zoom meetings as needed about various needs or services in order to maintain consistency and awareness of service offerings at campuses throughout the District. For example, APCAA managers email workshop, seminar, and final exam review information from each campus to be combined, shared, and updated on the APCAA webpage, calendar, and as a list to be distributed to faculty. Managers also email the manager group about online tutor scheduling needs and to coordinate weekend manager coverage for online tutoring.

Another line of communication vital to the APCAA is between APCAA managers and academic division staff and faculty. Each semester, associate deans and APCAA managers email and/or meet with each other regarding hours for adjunct faculty who also tutor in the APCAAs, lab instructor class assignments, and APCAA information to be distributed to all current faculty about the APCAA. Direct communication with faculty is also an important line of communication in which APCAA managers engage regularly. Via email, APCAA managers send requests to faculty for volunteer service tutoring hours and seminar presentations and scheduling class visits. This may include information faculty may want to share directly with students in their Canvas courses. Faculty also have access to the TracCloud application through a OneLogin tile, which allows them to submit faculty referrals (using SAGE) to APCAA managers.

The APCAA maintains general communication lines with other college departments as appropriate depending on mutual need, including student engagement services, advising, career centers, athletics, housing, and ACCESS. Often this communication is focused on sharing information with support staff about how students can access services, meeting specific student needs, and sharing information about upcoming workshops and events.

While not necessarily a unit responsible for supporting these services, a major line of communication facilitated by the APCAA staff is communication directly with students about services as well as records related to services they have utilized. The APCAA sends direct email communication to students for attendance verification and session summary notes for students who have attended tutoring or workshops/seminars/exam reviews so that students can submit these to professors for class related assignments. We also talk directly with students about services during class visits and at informational events like student engagement and orientation events. Students have direct online access through the TracCloud app on OneLogin to schedule tutoring appointments and to view service availability. The TracCloud dashboard also contains information about how to schedule tutoring sessions and about important policies.

Broader information distribution and communication lines available to all stakeholders, including those groups listed above, are coordinated efforts to create mass marketing materials like brochures and flyers posted in public areas and shared at events and in offices around the campus as well as information curated and posted on the APCAA webpage of Collin.edu, the APCAA Canvas Course, the new APCAA CougarWeb Widget, CougarConnect/Calendar, and CougarVision TVs. Anyone can access public-facing information, like the APCAA webpage on Collin.edu, CougarVision TV displays, brochures, and flyers. However, only students, faculty, and staff can access information posted inside Collin systems, like CougarWeb, Canvas, TracCloud.

Over the past few years, the APCAA managers have encountered issues with campuses having different regulations and processes for posting marketing materials on campus or online. Some of this is caused by changes in personnel overseeing these processes, differing campus leadership expectations, and various departmental requirements. Due to the volume of information and types of communication the APCAA publishes, as well as the large variety of the services the APCAA supports, maintaining all of these lines of communication throughout the District is challenging.

6. **Describe the alternate ways in which the unit or college provides any of these services.**

As previously discussed, the college contracts NetTutor to provide supplemental online tutoring support during times the APCAA is closed and in subjects with limited APCAA availability. Tutoring for a few specific disciplines is offered through academic affairs offices, including computer science (one tutor at the Allen Technical Campus), IT Networking (one tutor at the Frisco Campus), accounting (one tutor at the Frisco Campus), and communication/graphic design (one tutor at the Plano Campus). The nursing program at Collin College has been approved to hire a nursing tutor as well, but that grant-funded position has not been filled as of the writing of this report. Assistance with resumes is available through the Collin College Career Center, though the focus of the Career Center seems to be on general resume building and industry standards, whereas the APCAA Writing Centers focus on the quality of wording and rhetorical choices being made. Some faculty groups coordinate seminars and exam review offerings independent of those offered by the APCAA, particularly the math and science faculty, but those groups often connect with APCAA managers about utilizing presentation space and marketing these meetings to students, so there is still some level of connection between these alternate offerings and the APCAA.

7. **Does the unit offer or conduct the services as efficiently as possible? If not, explain why.**

Many changes during the last CIP cycle, including doubling the number of campus APCAAs, the adoption of a scheduling platform that centralized District online tutoring (TracCloud), and the growing demand for online tutoring appointments, in part driven by a pandemic and the creation of the iCollin Virtual Campus, have resulted in an online tutor scheduling structure built out of necessity and urgency to meet immediate demand based on the availabilities and skills of the tutors working at each of the District's physical campus locations. However, since the initial setup of online tutoring in TracCloud, staffing has become insufficient to meet growing online tutoring demands. The unit's online tutoring setup should be improved to ensure this service can meet student needs. Additionally, although improvements have been made during this CIP cycle to create the APCAA webpage and Canvas course, there is also room for improvement in how the unit markets its services to students who are working online. One particular challenge for communication is that class visits are a key way that APCAA staff engage with students and create a welcoming impression for the center. However, live class visits are not possible for the growing number of Web courses offered at Collin.

B. **Benchmarking: Review two or three comparable colleges for the way they accomplish these services. Discuss what was learned and what new ideas for service improvement were gained.**

Review of South Texas College Academic Support Services

South Texas College (STC) is a community college comprised of six campuses. Total enrollment is approximately 26,000 students. STC offers academic support services through their Center for Learning Excellence (CLE). STC has six physical CLE locations and offers online tutoring. The CLE locations are generally open from 8 am-6 pm on Mondays-Thursdays and from 8 am-3 pm on Fridays, with specific operation times varying slightly between campuses. Of note, the Nursing and Allied Health campus CLE opens at 7:30 am on weekdays and the Regional Center for Public Safety Excellence CLE is closed on Fridays. Online tutoring support is advertised as 24/7 because of the availability of tutoring through the Upswing platform. The CLE serves traditional students, a large population of dual credit students, and community members.

The CLE uses Upswing to schedule, execute and track in person and online tutoring services. Upswing is a software platform that supports tutoring appointment scheduling and meeting hosting, data tracking, and communication with students. The Upswing company can also provide integrated supplemental tutoring support through Upswing staff tutors. All tutoring services are currently by appointment, or as available if a student walks in. STC students are allowed four hours of tutoring per week with STC tutors through the CLE. STC students are limited to two appointments at the CLE per day. Students are allowed to use three hours of online tutoring from Upswing (non-STC) tutors per semester. Students can request additional tutoring sessions by submitting an online form to the CLE. In addition to in-person tutoring, the CLE also offers an asynchronous writing feedback service through which students receive feedback within 24-48 hours after submission. Students are limited to three asynchronous writing submissions per week.

The CLE offers some live workshops, by faculty request. STC also subscribes to Student Lingo for on-demand workshops that cover over 50 student success topics. These Student Lingo workshops are also used as part of a Student Success course. The CLE offers some workforce program support like dosage calculation workshops for allied health programs and police academy study skills support in connection with test preparation bootcamps.

The South Texas College CLE also offers supplemental Instruction (SI), which, according to the CLE supplemental instruction webpage, is a "series of free collaborative study sessions supporting students in specific, historically difficult courses" with "trained peers" who "facilitate these sessions outside of class and integrate study techniques with content review." The informational video on the webpage about SI advertises that students who participate in SI regularly tend to have improvements in their overall grades. This is a well-developed part of the CLE's student support services, as evidenced by a manager position dedicated to overseeing the program. The CLE also uses some embedded tutoring to support courses like technology, welding, and HVAC.

Academic Coaching is also available through the CLE. According to the CLE Academic Coaching webpage, these "coaches provide students with semester-long support in developing skills like using a planner, developing a study plan, avoiding procrastination, reading college-level textbooks, managing time more effectively, or improving communication." Faculty can also submit referrals for the CLE to reach out to students for tutoring through the Starfish platform, an early alert, intervention, and case management system.

TSI resources are available on the CLE website. These resources include videos covering key topics and links to online resources like practice tests. The CLE also offers tutoring for students preparing for the TSI. Some course textbooks can be checked out at campus CLE locations for up to two hours for study use while in the Center. Study rooms are available as well, with preference given to study groups over individuals.

Review of Austin Community College District Academic Support Services

Austin Community College District (ACC) is a community college that serves approximately 100,000 students across eleven campuses. ACC offers academic support through a variety of services. ACC Tutoring Services has eleven total locations and also offers online tutoring. ACC tutoring locations, Learning Labs and ACCelerator Labs, are collectively open from 9 am-8 pm on Mondays-Thursdays and from 9 am-5 pm Fridays, with specific operation times varying slightly between campuses. Four campuses offer fewer operating hours, closing at 5 pm on Mondays-Thursdays and closing on Fridays at 3 pm. Three physical campuses are open on Saturdays from 12 pm-6 pm, and the Highland campus is open on Sundays from 12 pm-6 pm. Online tutoring is advertised as being available from 9 am-8 pm on Mondays-Thursdays, 9 am-3 pm on Fridays, and 12 pm-6 pm on Saturdays and Sundays. The Learning Labs serve ACC students, including a large number of dual credit students. In a Zoom interview on November 12, 2024, the Manager of the Round Rock Campus Learning Lab, Michael McCarter, explained that tutoring though the Learning Lab is intended for prospective and enrolled students only. Community members who are looking for academic support are referred to Adult Education.

ACC uses a variety of academic support services to assist students. This includes Learning Labs with tutoring services and study space reservation services, ACCelerator Labs, departmental tutoring, writing center spaces, embedded tutoring, and academic coaching. The ACC academic coaches help students build personalized academic success strategies to use across all courses. Tutors help students with subject content and specific class assignments. ACC has recently added some spaces specifically designated as Writing Center spaces, separate from the Learning Labs.

Similar to South Texas College, ACC uses Upswing to schedule, meet with students, and track in-person and online tutoring services. Tutoring from ACC tutors is advertised on the webpage as being free and unlimited to students. Students are also allowed to use up to five hours of online tutoring from Upswing (non-ACC) tutors per semester to supplement Center staff availability.

The ACC tutoring webpage includes information sections for students and for faculty and staff. The webpage includes a chart of tutoring subjects available at each campus location. There are also pdf flyers on the webpage for specialized tutoring availability, like anatomy and physiology, foreign language, ESOL, pharmacology, photography, and statistics, as well as tutoring to help students prepare for Course Readiness Assessments for biology, ESOL, and math courses. The pdfs also list other tutoring available through academic departments. Additionally, this tutoring services webpage advertises six on-demand workshops on key topics. There are also some live writing and research support events hosted with the library. Some assessment study materials, including those for the TSI, are available on the ACC website. The section of the webpage dedicated to faculty and staff includes information on the support offered to faculty, contact information to schedule a classroom visit, and a form to request computer lab reservations. Additionally, on this page there is a referral form to complete for faculty and staff to refer students for tutoring services.

Two additional ACC academic support offerings include embedded tutoring and supplemental instruction. ACC offers faculty the opportunity to embed tutors (professional tutoring staff, academic coaches, and SI tutors) into online and in-person courses to encourage academic success. This service is also promoted on the dedicated Embedded Learning Support webpage that includes an explanation of embedded tutoring, a promotional video with both student and professor testimonials, and bulleted examples of how embedded tutors can assist in a course. Additionally, the ACC SI program provides peer-led support for select courses each semester, with the schedule of SI-supported courses linked on the ACC Supplemental Instruction webpage. Students are welcome to attend as many SI sessions as are offered for their courses, free of charge. This webpage explains that "SI Leaders attend classes, take notes, and facilitate collaborative study sessions, usually held before or after class, all while getting paid for their efforts." The SI FAQ page also includes that "students who regularly participate in SI sessions perform on average a full letter grade better than students who don't take advantage of the service." There is also a short promotional clip on the SI webpage with student testimonials on how the SI program helped them in their courses.

Insight from Benchmark Review of Peer Institutions

Compared to South Texas College and the Austin Community College District, Collin College APCAA's generally have more comprehensive hours, with campus APCAA locations collectively open Mondays-Thursdays between 9 am and 8 pm, Fridays between 9 am and 5 pm, and Saturdays between 9 am and 5 pm to best serve non-traditional students. Additionally, the APCAAs offer online tutoring seven days a week during each long semester, Wintermester, Maymester, and summer sessions, all of which is covered by APCAA tutors instead of being outsourced. From the review of these two peer institutions, a few elements stand out that could help inform Collin College's APCAA planning. These ideas include:

- Embedded tutoring, SI, and collaboration with academic coaching
- Website promotional strategies
- Awareness of other software platforms

A key area of potential growth identified during the benchmark review was the use of embedded tutoring, an SI program, and collaboration with academic coaching to provide academic assistance to students. Although embedded tutoring has been offered as part of the Collin College APCAA's Foundational Academic Success Tutoring (FAST) program, the success for embedded tutoring at Collin varied by campus depending on implementation and faculty involvement. The APCAAs offer the opportunity for tutors to embed into classes upon faculty request outside of the FAST program. Additionally, there is no formal SI program. These efforts are more developed, organized, and promoted by South Texas College and Austin Community College District. STC has a dedicated manager overseeing supplemental instruction. ACC's Learning Support Services is a collaborative effort between academic coaches, embedded tutors, and SI leaders. Although institutional organization and staffing structures differ between the Collin College's APCAAs and the institutions reviewed during this benchmark, some foundational elements could be used to inform the possible implementation of similar programs for Collin College, should the District decide to move towards a more formal embedded tutoring and/or SI program. Additionally, collaboration with academic coaches by both the STC's Center for Learning Excellence and ACC's Academic Support Services stands out as a possible

opportunity for the APCAAs to explore in order to better integrate with other areas of the District, including advising, counseling, and the Academic Planning Coach Program.

Secondly, some promotional techniques can be gleaned from both STC's Center for Learning Excellence and ACC's Learning Support Services webpages. This is particularly timely as one of the CIP outcomes going forward focuses on improving and streamlining information about APCAA services, in part through the creation of a promotional video clip. A few different elements incorporated into the webpages of these two institutions include promotional video clips that address the resources offered with video testimony by both a student and a faculty member speaking to the value of the academic assistance services, an instructional video that outlines how to schedule a tutoring session through Upswing, and a webpage designated specifically for faculty and staff that articulates how the ACC Learning Lab supports students and faculty, best practices for how faculty can help the Learning Labs support their students, and collaborative opportunities. With the new CIP outcomes focused on improving promotion and communication of APCAA services, incorporating one or more of these elements might help improve promotion and communication about APCAA services.

Finally, both institutions that were part of this benchmark review used the Upswing platform to facilitate and track tutoring appointments with their in-house tutors as well as to provide additional tutoring from Upswing tutors. Additionally, South Texas College subscribes to Student Lingo to provide workshops for students and to the Starfish Early Alert system. Collin College APCAAs currently have software to track and facilitate tutoring appointments (TracCloud), a referral system (the SAGE feature of TracCloud), a subscription to provide additional tutoring, especially in content areas not covered by APCAA staff (NetTutor) and offer both online (synchronous and asynchronous) and in-person workshops developed and presented by Collin College faculty, tutoring staff, and staff outside of the APCAAs. However, learning more about how peer institutions utilize different software programs to best provide academic assistance for their students compliments the APCAA efforts that took place leading up to the adoption and implementation of TracCloud as it increases knowledge and awareness of other software solutions available on the market and how different institutions are using them. Staying abreast of the current market will serve managers well in the future if other software platforms develop as a better match for District APCAA needs.

IV. UNIT'S IMPACT ON STUDENT OUTCOMES

A. If the unit influences the student experience, environment, and/or safety, describe how.

Experience and Environment:

The APCAAs enhance the student experience by creating a welcoming and supportive environment where they can receive tutoring assistance or study independently. Physical spaces across the District offer a variety of configurations to enable these activities in a pleasant

atmosphere where students feel comfortable. The centers contain a variety of workspaces for both individuals and groups and are stocked with the necessary supplies and equipment students need, such as print stations, whiteboards, science models, and relevant textbooks. The APCAA mission statement is prominently displayed in each center to reinforce our goals for students.

Beyond the physical elements, center staff are trained to be friendly and welcoming so as to encourage students to use our spaces and services. All personnel are trained to immediately acknowledge visitors, greet everyone pleasantly, and promptly respond to questions or assist students. Tutors are addressed by first names in order to put students at ease. Those with appointments are directed to their tutors. Telephone calls are answered and/or returned in a timely manner with hold times kept to a minimum. Full-time staff or APCAA managers address student concerns immediately and follow up as needed. Evening and weekend students receive the same welcome and services as weekday students.

From Fall 2020 through Summer 2023, surveys were collected asking students to rate the overall quality of their tutoring experience at the APCAA Centers. As noted in Appendix I of the 4-year CIP report, the surveys indicated a level of "good," "very good," or "excellent" in an average of 96% to 100% of respondents across the District—with almost all of those falling in the "very good" or "excellent" category.

Safety:

APCAA personnel work to maintain a safe environment for students, and the physical set up of the centers reflects that desire. Managers' offices are located inside the centers to facilitate rapid response to emergency situations. In order to support appropriate crisis response, managers or APCAA full-time staff members serve on the Emergency Response Teams at their campuses, and all full- and part-time employees must attend CRASE training. In addition, staff receive training regarding SOBI and learn which concerns should be directed to the SOBI committee. Staff are informed about Collin College police and how/when to contact them for assistance; of course, all rooms are equipped with the emergency contact number for quick reference. All employees are given extensive safety materials in their handbooks which are reviewed with staff by managers. First aid kits are available in each APCAA, and staff are shown where defibrillators are located. Most managers have attended Emergency Response Team courses and have learned first aid techniques.

    B. **If the unit impacts funding for student activities, describe how.**

       N/A

    C. **If the unit influences student enrollment, retention, persistence, and/or completion, describe how.**

Purpose:

The APCAAs *exist* to aid in student retention, persistence, and completion. Although faculty members support students both inside and outside the classroom--through office hours, individual appointments, and written feedback—they are unable to provide a high number of contact hours per student. The APCAA, therefore, augments classroom instruction through services that support student mastery of material and skills. All our services and programs are geared to not only assist students academically, but to provide a supportive and encouraging space where staff can bolster students' confidence and help relieve their stress and anxiety. We not only provide content and skill-related support, but we reinforce study skills, time management, and good academic habits—all of which promote student success.

Programs and Services:

The APCAAs are known for our tutoring services which we provide in a number of disciplines, including but not limited to Math, Science, Reading, Writing, Accounting, Economics, and Spanish. Educated professional staff—all of whom have degrees in pertinent subjects—work one-on-one with students, either in-person or virtually, to provide the needed assistance or instruction that will help students move forward on their own. Group tutoring and review sessions are also provided in certain subjects. A specialized program for developmental education students provides specially trained tutors who are familiar with that curriculum and are particularly suited to work with that population; called FAST (Foundational Academic Success Tutoring), the special tutors associated with this program are available at the four major campuses as well as online. Faculty members volunteer their time to supplement the paid tutors, particularly supporting subjects where tutoring is more limited, such as certain science subjects. Finally, some faculty members choose to conduct their office hours within our centers as an added encouragement for students to attend tutoring sessions beyond meeting with their professor.

In addition to tutoring, the centers offer a number of other programs and services, including but not limited to the following:

- In-person and virtual workshops on pertinent academic topics
- Test review sessions
- Pre-recorded video seminars (25+) on writing topics, available anytime online
- Embedded tutoring where staff members support students during class sessions
- Handouts in digital or printed formats
- TSI preparation materials and tutor assistance
- Preparation materials for GED, Vet Tech, and other certification testing
- Access to textbooks, including those used by faculty, and calculators

- Access to science models
- Collaborative programs, such as the Library/Writing Center collaborations at the Frisco Campus for MAPS (Map and Plan Sessions) or Career center/Writing Center collaborations for resume reviews.
- Monitored independent study space where students can ask questions as they work
- Group study space where students can work on group projects or convene a study group

Data:

Visits:

Table IV-1: District-wide Visits

School year	Total visits	Percent increase	Visits excluding independent study/printing	Percent increase
2022 – 2023	44,987		33,354	
2023 – 2024	55,424	23%	37,885	14%

Indication of learning:

As part of our 4-year report, we examined voluntary survey results to tie completion rates to the use of tutoring services. In our survey, we asked students to list a "strategy for success" that they learned during their tutoring session, with a goal of having at least 70% of survey respondents answer that question meaningfully. (This data was limited to the students who voluntarily filled out a survey regarding their experience. The question referred to above was considered an "optional" response, so a student may have chosen not to take the time to answer it, even if they learned something and *could* have answered it.)

As described in Outcome #2 of that report, 77% of the students provided an answer to the "strategy for success" question, meeting our goal and illustrating that students recognized the learning that took place during tutoring sessions.

Completion rates in relation to tutoring visits:

Many factors influence a student's ability to succeed in their courses and to continue on a path toward finishing a certificate or degree. Although we feel confident that students who seek assistance from tutoring and other support programs are likely to be more successful than those who do not, providing a direct connection between tutoring use and completion can be difficult.

We also looked at attendance rates in the centers (two or more tutoring sessions), which we then compared the course completion rate for those who attended sessions with those who did not. For completion rates with a grade of "C" or better, these are the District-wide compiled results (as detailed in Appendices D-H from Zogotech):

Table IV-2
Completion Rates in Reading/Writing Courses:

Semester	Course	Completion rate of entire enrollment	Completion rate of students attending 2+ tutoring sessions
Fall 2022	ENGL 1301	74%	95%
	INRW 0315	53%	88%
	INRW 0405	54%	89%
Spring 2023	ENGL 1301	56%	83%
	INRW 0315	55%	88%
	INRW 0405	47%	88%
Fall 2023	ENGL 1301	76%	94%
	INRW 0315	51%	92%

	INRW 0405	51%	88%

Table IV -3
Completion Rates in Math Courses:

Semester	Course	Completion rate of entire enrollment	Completion rate of students attending 2+ tutoring sessions
Fall 2022	MATH 1314	64%	68%
	MATH 1324	50%	55%
	MATH 1342	64%	74%
	MATH 0405	59%	80%
Spring 2023	MATH 1314	52%	60%
	MATH 1324	49%	58%
	MATH 1342	71%	74%
	MATH 0405	56%	67%
Fall 2023	MATH 1314	64%	65%
	MATH 1324	52%	69%
	MATH 1342	63%	79%
	MATH 0405	59%	66%

As mentioned in Section A above, student satisfaction with APCAA services is very high according to collected surveys; positive responses average between 96% and 100% across the District for the period of 2021 – 2023. Another survey question asks respondents if they felt better prepared to complete their assignment after a tutoring session. The response rates are similar. For example, in the Frisco Writing Center surveys from August 2022 – August 2024, 96% of the 801 respondents indicated "strongly agree" or "agree" with this question.

Below are some sample comments from student surveys:

"My session with Emily was super helpful in making me more confident in answering the writing prompt for my Philosophy class."

"Learned how to find derivative and critical numbers"

"I went in for brainstorming on an assignment and came out knowing exactly what i was going to do."

"Brandon is always so helpful, funny, and friendly. I will continue to go to him for my math assignment help."

"My tutor did a wonderful job helping me out and gave me a better understanding of an argumentative essay."

"Great, great experience, cannot wait to discuss my writing with Darcy again!"

"I was able to get clarification on a lot of concepts I was confused about. Specifically logarithmic properties."

"Really helped the development and quality of my writing"

D. If the unit provides services for a diverse student population, describe how.

The APCAA centers strive to meet the needs of all Collin College students, who are diverse not only in their backgrounds, ages, and academic readiness, but also in their needs for specific instructional modes and schedules. Below is a list of the variety of students and the ways APCAA centers offer assistance:

- **Potential or new students** – Those who are ready to apply to the College or who initially have failed the TSI test are encouraged to take advantage of our TSI services. Tutors can review practice tests with students so they understand the areas where they need to improve, and staff can then tutor them in content and skills related to those deficiencies.

- **Developmental Education (Dev Ed) students**: Managers work closely with Dev Ed faculty to support students who are trying increase their skills to college level or who are enrolled in co-requisite support courses.
  - Together with the Dev Ed department, managers created the FAST program, which stands for Foundational Academic Success Tutoring. The four main campuses each have at least one FAST tutor in each discipline (INRW & Dev Ed Math), and there is one fully online tutor in each.
  - FAST tutors are more familiar with the Dev Ed curriculum and focus on the needs particular to this population in order to best support their course completion.
  - In addition, centers offer embedded tutoring where a tutor is assigned to a class in order to offer ongoing support. Sometimes the tutor attends every week, while for other classes, one or two tutors come help during specific "work days." The instructor and the manager decide together how to best approach embedding for that class.
  - Data received from the Business Intelligence & Data Warehousing department (Zogotech), indicates the following regarding the numbers of students taking one or more Dev Ed courses:

    Table IV-4

    Percentage of Students enrolled in Dev Ed courses

Academic Year	Unduplicated Headcount – Enrollment	Dev Ed Headcount	Percentage of Students taking Dev Ed courses
2022-23	49,651	5,528	11.1%
2023-24	52,674	5,478	10.4%

  - With such a high percentage of students taking Dev Ed courses, the centers are integral to the persistence and completion rates of these courses.
- **ENGL students earning lab credits:** All students enrolled in ENGL 1301 or 1302 are required to earn 16 lab credits during the course.
  - Many instructors require students to attend tutoring sessions or suggest that attending tutoring sessions will contribute toward those credits.

o   In addition, many professors give lab credits for attending other APCAA programs, such as live workshops and other educational events, or for watching some of more than 25 recorded video seminars.

Table IV - 5

Number of Live Workshops/Exam Reviews offered by each campus – 2023/24 school year

Celina	41
Farmersville	6
Frisco	65
McKinney	54
Plano	47
Technical/Allen	50
Wylie	79
TOTAL	342

- **Evening/Weekend students:** Because classes are offered at various days and times during the week, the centers strive to reflect that variety in their availability of services.
    - o   Although the schedule varies by campus, in-person tutoring is offered between the overall hours of 9 a.m. and 8 p.m. on weekdays and between 9 a.m. and 5 p.m. on Saturdays.
    - o   Online tutoring is offered 7 days per week, as late as 9 p.m.
    - o   Email accounts are monitored seven days per week to troubleshoot online appointments and to answer student questions, with managers rotating coverage after hours and on weekends.
    - o   Services such as class orientation visits are offered to evening and weekend college professors by request.

- **iCollin students**: Although limited virtual tutoring was offered for several years prior to the pandemic in 2020, the program was significantly expanded during that time and has remained robust.
  - Tutoring is offered 7 days per week as late as 9 pm to help meet the needs of students taking online classes who may not be able to visit a campus center.
  - As the number of online and hybrid classes has increased during the past five years, the APCAA has significantly increased the amount of support available online—as much as current budgets will allow.
  - Almost all workshops are now offered online (often simultaneously with on-campus workshops), so that iCollin students can more easily attend—even on evenings and weekends.
- **Dual credit students:** As dual credit enrollment has grown exponentially over the past several years, the APCAA centers have prioritized ways to meet their needs. **During the 2023/24 school year, 3,412 visits were made by dual credit students District-wide.**
  - Center staff conduct class visits at dual credit high schools.
  - Evening and weekend hours, plus online sessions, help to meet the needs of students who cannot obtain services during normal school hours.
  - Off-site services are made available at dual credit locations. One example are special writing tutoring days, held three times per semester since Spring 2022, that are conducted by Frisco Writing Center staff at The Colony High School's Collegiate Academy, where as many as 33 students have attended tutoring in one day.
  - Many workshops are offered virtually—and during evenings and weekends--to make it easier for dual credit students to attend. Of the 613 online workshop attendees, 118 were dual credit students, which is about 20%. In addition, some may have attended in-person workshops.
  - In addition, dual credit students often need to use online tutoring sessions because of issues with transportation and being unable to attend daytime sessions due to school schedules. As mentioned above, the APCAA has increased the amount of online tutoring sessions offered—as much as current budgets will allow—to help meet this demand.
- **ACCESS students:** The APCAAs often work with students who need various types of accommodation.
  - Sometimes an ASL interpreter is needed during a session.
  - For low vision students, a center computer may be modified to allow for larger print.
  - Students on the autism spectrum may need to be taken to another space away from noise or a place where they can get up and move around during a session.

- o   Any ACCESS student is entitled to have longer sessions any time they choose, for both in-person and online tutoring appointments.
- **Economically disadvantaged students:** Some students may not have access to current technology, while others lack a proper place to study and complete their work at home.
    - o   Centers provide computers and printers for student use.
    - o   Study tables and/or rooms are available where they can have a quieter place to study or complete assignments.
    - o   Facilities are offered during our open hours into the evening and, for some campuses, on Saturdays, so students have a variety of options for using them.
    - o   Some centers let students check out laptops and calculators for class.

E.   **Analyze the evidence you provide. What does it show about the unit?**

The APCAA Centers have continued to successfully meet the needs of students who need assistance in a variety of subjects.

Analysis of Section C:

- **Visits**: During the past full school year (2023/24), 55,424 visits were completed District-wide, which represents a 14% increase over the previous year, as noted in Table IV-1 above. Since that increase is higher than the increase in enrollment, these totals indicate that more and more students are being made aware of and are taking advantage of our services.
- **Indication of Learning:** As demonstrated in survey results described in the 4-year CIP report, 77% of students voluntarily recognized the learning they achieved during their session. (The percentage may be quite a bit higher than that number indicates because the question was not required—meaning some students may have chosen not to answer even though they recognized the learning that took place.)
- **Completion rate in relation to tutoring visits:** As the data in Tables IV-2 and IV-3 shows, students who attended at least two sessions of tutoring were overall more successful in completing courses. For Reading/Writing courses, the overall completion rate ranges between 47% and 74%, while the completion rate of those who attend 2+ tutoring sessions ranges between 88% and 95%. For Math courses, the overall completion rate ranges between 49% and 71% while the completion rate of those attending 2+ tutoring sessions ranges between 55% and 80%. The differentials are greater for reading/writing courses than for math courses; one way to look at this is that students who attended math lab sessions were likely to be struggling more with the concepts in the first place and may have been less likely to succeed even with the assistance. The center managers still believe there is a clear indication that those who

attend tutoring are more likely to complete their course. In addition, the high rate of student satisfaction with APCAA services, as discussed above, contributes to the likelihood they will complete their course.

- **Persistence and Retention:** Students who are getting the assistance they need with their assignments are much more likely to persist, to complete their courses, and to continue to enroll for future courses. In addition to the completion rates noted above, the anecdotal comments from surveys indicate they tend to connect with tutors and have a more positive attitude about their assignments after tutoring sessions—which ultimately contributes to retention and completion rates.

Analysis of Section D:

APCAA centers are constantly adjusting services and programs to accommodate the various needs of Collin College students. As shown in the list in Section D above, the centers offer tutoring specific to certain types of students, such as Developmental Education or ACCESS, while also providing services to support ENGL students in earning their lab credits or giving exam reviews for MATH students. Centers provide a range of hours in campus locations while also offering virtual tutoring seven days a week. This range of days and hours particularly facilitates iCollin and Dual Credit students, both of which are steadily increasing, who may have trouble seeking in-person tutoring at a physical campus. Due to circumstances beyond our control, student needs currently exceed our ability to offer enough online tutoring sessions, particularly for writing and science. Overall, the unit is constantly keeping abreast of how the needs of students may be changing or increasing so that services and programs can be changed or developed to meet those needs.

V.   EFFECTIVENESS OF UNIT COMMUNICATIONS

A. **Describe with evidence how the unit literature and electronic sites are current, including accurately representing the unit and supporting the college's recruitment plan, retention plan, and completion plan.**

The unit literature and electronic sites are crucial to creating awareness of APCAA services and programs for both students and faculty. With that at the forefront, the center managers prioritize communication in various forms, including a wide range of promotional materials, in an effort to inform students and encourage them to participate. In addition, our communication efforts are often aimed at faculty so they can encourage and incentivize students to take advantage of the assistance offered by the APCAAs. As has been shown above, students are more likely to complete courses and continue to pursue degrees/certificates when they are availing themselves of tutoring and support services. The Unit Literature Table includes an extensive list of various communication methods used to achieve this end.

1. **Describe how the unit solicits student feedback regarding its website and literature and how the unit incorporates that feedback to make improvements.**

Surveys are emailed to students and are also available on the dashboard of TracCloud, the scheduling system used by the APCAAs. The surveys ask students to identify "how they heard about the APCAA," followed by an extensive list of options. Students can choose multiple answers to reflect more than one method if appropriate. Reviewing these responses helps managers determine what methods are reaching the audience. If certain methods are not effective, managers discuss ways to modify or replace those methods with others that are more so. Beyond that, managers use anecdotal feedback from students to tweak the details. For example, when a few students indicated they couldn't figure out how to upload their documents to their appointment in TracCloud, a guide with screenshots was created and posted on the TracCloud dashboard for reference purposes.

2. **Describe how the unit ensures that students are informed/aware of unit literature. Is unit literature made accessible to all students (i.e., can they obtain the information they need)?**

The APCAA reaches students using a myriad of methods to provide information about what we do, where our centers are located, when they are open, and how students can access services both in person and online. It should be noted that APCAAs are not allowed to send mass emails directly to students, so communicating through faculty is also a necessary element of reaching students. These methods include the following:

- Page on collin.edu main website which contains hot links to support materials
- Widget on CougarWeb
- Tile on OneLogin that connects to our scheduling platform, TracCloud; the dashboard contains information about how to schedule and overall policies.
- Workshops and other event listings on CougarConnect
- Workshop and other event listings on the CougarWeb calendar
- Canvas Course: students can self-enroll
- Flyers posted on bulletin boards at campuses

- Info tables staffed and brochures given out at resource fairs, CAT camp, campus events and available at collaborative departments such as libraries and career centers.
- Slides on CougarVision
- Emails sent to faculty containing materials they can post in their courses or present in class.
- Visits by staff to individual classes to give out materials and explain services, including visits to dual credit campuses

Table V - 1

Number of Class Visits for 2023/24 school year

Celina	85
Farmersville	33
Frisco	86
McKinney	70
Plano	329
Technical/Allen	21
Wylie	111
TOTAL	735

3. **Identify who is responsible for monitoring and maintaining the unit's website, and describe the processes in place to ensure that information is current, accurate, relevant, and available. If the unit has no website, describe plans for creation of a website or explain the absence.**

Some of these materials are maintained through a collaboration of managers. For example, the webpage and CougarWeb Widget/Calendar liaison is Joan Reese, APCAA Manager at Wylie. She gathers information from managers each semester to update the postings, working with Web Services staff as needed. Similarly, the APCAA brochure is coordinated by Holly Stone, APCAA Manager at Farmersville. When updates are needed, she solicits input from other managers and works with the Communications Department for updates so that each manager can order brochures each year. Other materials are campus-specific and are maintained and updated by individual managers each semester, such as flyers or information pages provided to faculty for their courses.

B. **In the Unit Literature Review Table, document that the unit verified the information communicated to stakeholders for currency, accuracy, and relevance and made it readily available to target audiences.**

Upload the completed Unit Literature Review Table in section V.B. of the Appendix.

VI.   EFFECTIVENESS OF UNIT STAKEHOLDER RESOURCES AND PARTNERSHIPS

In the Unit Stakeholder Resources and Partnerships Table, list any business, industry, government, college, university, community, and/or consultant partnerships, including clinical or professional sites and internal Collin departments, to advance unit outcomes.

Upload the completed Unit Stakeholder Resources and Partnerships Table in section VI. of the Appendix.

VII.   PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

In the Employee Resources Table, provide a list of professional development activities of unit staff since the last Service Unit Review.

Upload the completed Employee Resources Table in section VII. of the Appendix.

VIII.   FACILITIES, EQUIPMENT, AND FUNDING (OPTIONAL)

NOTE: Respond to section VIII only if the unit is requesting improved resources.

A. **Provide evidence regarding current deficiencies or potential deficiencies related to infrastructure (e.g., technology), facilities, equipment, maintenance, replacement, plans, or budgets that pose important barriers to the unit or student success.**

The Facilities Resources table, Equipment/Technology table, and the Financial Resources table that are attached in the Appendix section include requests determined by each campus APCAA manager in collaboration with their campus leadership. Although there are some common themes that run through the requests, including updated spaces for Science Dens and increased need to hire tutoring staff, each campus's APCAA needs are unique. Each request is paired with the manager's justification of why this request has been submitted and how this request will impact APCAA operations.

One overall need of the unit that impacts all campus APCAAs is an increased tutoring staff budget to meet the demand for online tutoring appointments. Currently, there is no budget allotted to the unit for exclusively online tutors. The online tutoring schedule is currently staffed by tutors who also work on different campuses and provide face-to-face tutoring appointments. Due to this dual responsibility, especially during key weeks of the semester when Districtwide tutoring demand is high, managers must choose between staffing their in-person tutoring schedules or contributing to the online tutoring schedule. Fulfilling both needs is critical, and more work must be done to determine the best way to move forward with remedying this issue. Due to this staffing problem, District APCAAs have addressed this with one of the two new outcomes going forward. Identifying this need as an outcome helps the APCAA managers dedicate sufficient time, energy, and resources to identify the best way to fulfill increased demand for online tutoring.

B. **If any current or potential deficiencies exist, complete the resource tables below to support your narrative.**

1. **Facilities Resources Table**

    Upload the completed Facilities Resources Table in section VIII.B.1. of the Appendix.

2. **Equipment/Technology Table ($5,000 or More)**

    Upload the completed Equipment/Technology Table ($5,000 or More) in section VIII.B.2. of the Appendix.

3. **Financial Resources Table**

    Upload the completed Financial Resources Table in section VIII.B.3. of the Appendix.

IX. CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT PLAN (CIP)

A. **Upload the unit's previous CIP tables in section IX.A. of the Appendix.**

    In addition, e-mail the unit's previous CIP tables to the Institutional Research Office (IRO) at effectiveness@collin.edu.

B. **Describe how the unit used its last Continuous Improvement Plan (CIP) to make the following improvements to the unit over the past 4 years:**

    1. **Student support**

One of the goals accomplished through the last CIP was the creation of an official District APCAA mission statement. This statement is now displayed for students on the APCAA web page, on promotional materials, and on signage across all centers. The completion of this goal improves student support as it articulates the mission that drives District APCAA services. District APCAAs use the mission statement to communicate to students the importance the unit places on empowering them to become independent thinkers.

Another goal accomplished through the last CIP was the creation of a set of standard survey questions that students across all campuses receive after a visit to an APCAA. This standardization improved student support by streamlining the student experience, regardless of which campus they visited and the modality of the services they accessed. This standardization also allowed District APCAAs to compare a common set of data across the District, enabling APCAA staff to see trends, respond to student concerns, and quickly pinpoint and address needs for improvement.

The creation of the APCAA web page that can be accessed on the collin.edu website (https://www.collin.edu/studentresources/tutoring/index.html) has helped streamline communication to current and future Collin College students. This web page centralizes important information, including guides for how to schedule and cancel tutoring appointments; notices to help remedy common student questions; subject tutoring flyers for the semester; and campus-specific information, including contact information, location, semester hours, flyers for semester events, and workshop schedules. This web page is updated regularly and provides students with a central spot to access the information they need regarding District APCAA services.

The Districtwide implementation of TracCloud has improved student support in various ways. With previous scheduling platforms, students had to create a separate account to view District availabilities, and each campus had their own independent online tutoring schedule. There was no centralized way for students to search for tutoring across all campuses at the same time. The implementation of TracCloud has

centralized all tutoring schedules across the District into one platform and has centralized all online tutoring offerings into one profile. This reduces barriers between students and all APCAA resources, no matter where they are located. With TracCloud, a student can now search for tutoring availability Districtwide, both online and in person, from a single dashboard, with a single search. Students can filter this search by using different criteria, including their preferred campus and mode (in-person or online). Students can search for one-on-one, group, and walk-in tutoring appointments around the District from their dashboards. The implementation of TracCloud has also situated all student information in TracCloud behind OneLogin. This requires students to remember and/or store less login information and protects student data. Additionally, TracCloud's customizable sign-in setup has simplified the process students use to sign in and out for in-person tutoring appointments and use of other lab resources, which again reduces the time barriers between students and the District APCAA resources they seek.

2. **Overall improvements to the unit**

The creation of a Districtwide tutor manual to accompany the extant student assistant manual has improved the unit by creating a common document that articulates the APCAA mission, standards, practices, and procedures to be used by tutoring staff across the District, ensuring that all visitors receive the same level of service regardless of which APCAA they visit. This regularly updated manual ensures that all new and existing tutoring staff have access to updated resources and campus and District information to best serve students. These manuals also serve as a foundation for onboarding and training new staff members, as well as support if staff behavior requires a discussion.

The creation of a shared drive where the APCAAs can build a bank of professional development resources will also improve the unit. The APCAAs now have a framework to start building upon with professional development links and resources that can target tutoring best practices and knowledge in different content areas. Work on this project will increase collaboration among District APCAA staff as well as increase consistency and standardization across the District.

Another goal accomplished by the unit during the previous CIP was a target of a higher completion rate (with a grade of C or higher) in INRW 0315, INRW 0405, ENGL 1301, MATH 1314, MATH 1342, MATH 1342, and MATH 0405 courses by students who attended two or more Writing Center or Math Lab appointments in a long semester compared to students who did not attend any tutoring appointments. Although it is impossible to say that tutoring caused the higher completion rates, the accomplishment of this goal has improved the overall unit in a couple of ways. Compiling the CWIDs of students who attended tutoring appointments following each long semester within the scope of this goal across eight different profiles (seven campuses and an online tutoring profile) has improved cross-campus communication

and collaboration, strengthened APCAA manager understanding of data compilation in TracCloud, and sharpened our ability to use different functions of Excel in data analysis. Working towards this goal during the last CIP also involved consulting the District's Director of Business Intelligence & Data Warehousing to pull data regarding course completion rates from ZogoTech. This collaboration helped establish a framework for compiling and pulling data that can be used in the future to continue researching the impact the APCAAs have on student success in their courses.

The previous CIP included a few different goals related to survey questions, including the creation of a standard set of survey questions and answer sets to be used Districtwide, the increase in overall survey participation, and the increase in answers to a specific question that asked students to list a strategy for success they learned during their tutoring appointment. The completion of these goals has resulted in some overall improvements to the unit:

First, the completion of these goals strengthened manager knowledge of different strategies to increase response rates, both of the survey as a whole, and for the targeted success strategy question. For example, leading up to the 2-year report, managers pulled reports to identify the top twenty professors whose students were attending online appointments in the Fall 2021 semester, and managers reached out to the professors to request that they encourage their students to complete post-appointment surveys. This was done specifically because a snapshot of responses taken from the Fall 2021 semester until October 2021 showed that most students heard about the APCAAs through their professor or Canvas course, speaking to the importance of more robust collaboration between the APCAAs and faculty. Managers further strategized using the survey features of TracCloud, SurveyTrac, to remedy survey fatigue some students were experiencing. Students who attended multiple tutoring appointments throughout the semester would receive a notice on their TracCloud dashboard to complete a survey after each appointment. Some students were sent multiple survey notices in a short period, which was leading to survey fatigue. To combat this, APCAA managers decided to adjust the settings of the surveys to be sent only after the first and fourth appointment within a given timeframe. The timeframe was then manually adjusted to encompass roughly a month at a time. Even after the 4-year report was turned in, managers continued to explore new ways to improve the survey experience for students. Over summer 2024, the manager group created a copy of each survey and archived the old copy. As a result, all old notices of uncompleted surveys were removed from student dashboards. Although it is impossible to say one or more of these strategies managers implemented to increase survey completion rates caused the overall increase noted in the 4-year report, the efforts towards this part of the CIP did sharpen the unit's knowledge regarding SurveyTrac features and strategies to help better address student concerns.

The creation of the Districtwide survey question and answer set also fills an important need that was emphasized during the unit's 2020 program review. Before this CIP, there was no way to gather and compare Districtwide survey data from students in terms of impact and

satisfaction. However, as a result of this CIP, the unit collaborated to create a common set of survey questions and answers. The unit now has a way to gather Districtwide survey data and to examine different trends within this data. As discussed in the 4-year report, the unit has already started examining trends in these surveys, such as completion rates and satisfaction rates, to help target different support areas that need improvement.

The selection and implementation of the TracCloud scheduling platform also resulted in overall improvements to the unit. The platform selection process involved identifying managers to serve on a platform search committee and taking a critical eye to what was needed in the scheduling software, what would be ideal, and what would be unnecessary for the platform adopted by District APCAAs. Going forward, this framework can be adapted to facilitate future Districtwide APCAA decisions as well. This platform selection process also increased the unit's knowledge about platforms currently available on the market and increased collaboration between APCAA managers and leadership from other learning centers. We worked with the Student Success Center at The University of Alabama in Huntsville and the Teaching/Learning Center at Delta College in Michigan to learn more about how these institutions were using the platform to serve their students.

The implementation of TracCloud also improved the unit as it removed the need for each student to individually register for an account and manually enter their information, including their CWID and collin.edu email address, as was done with previous scheduling platforms. With TracCloud, student data is imported nightly from Workday Student and previously from Banner. This data import results in less effort for students, as they no longer manually enter this information on a registration screen. This data import also results in more accurate data for the unit. Student information, including CWIDs, collin.edu email addresses, current class registrations, and instructors of record are automatically imported to TracCloud each evening, improving the unit's ability to pull different reports and analyze student, appointment, and visit data.

TracCloud's implementation leading up to Fall, 2022, as well as ongoing adaptation and implementation of different features, such as the SAGE faculty referral system, strengthened managers' ability to work with different software features. Through building out different features of TracCloud, such as each campus's profile, centers within each profile, custom email templates, etc., the manager group has learned how to work with Twig commands and troubleshoot the system in different ways. This effort has also resulted in increased collaboration between the unit and Collin's IT department to remedy different issues, such as ensuring emails from TracCloud were received by student collin.edu email accounts and ensuring the transition from Banner to Workday Student did not interrupt the nightly data import to TracCloud.

Along with increased manager knowledge and ability to adapt to a software change that affected all services offered through the APCAAs, the accomplishment of this goal also resulted in the establishment of a framework for how to train District APCAA tutoring and administrative staff on the new platform. To train District APCAA staff, preliminary in-person trainings were held across different campuses and online during Summer, 2022. To provide ongoing support for both existing and new staff, APCAA managers created TracCloud guides that walked staff through different processes, such as schedule building, updating appointment statuses, completing visit notes, creating ad hoc appointments, and adding community members to the system. The creation of these systems and guides helped streamline and increase staff knowledge across the District and also ensure that new staff members hired by District APCAAs receive the same onboarding training as current employees have received.

Additionally, to remedy frequent TracCloud technical issues that arise across different campuses, the unit has identified two APCAA managers to serve as TracCloud support managers. A system has been put into place where technical issues are run through the two support managers who first try to identify and resolve the issue before contacting TracCloud's technical support team, Redrock Software Helpdesk.

These initiatives as part of the previous CIP have resulted in District APCAAs moving away from a siloed approach and towards a more cohesive unit. Although each campus is still able to adapt services and approaches to the needs of the specific campuses they serve, there is also more collaboration and communication through monthly meetings, shared staff manual templates, common survey questions, and common use of the TracCloud scheduling software.

X.   EVALUATION OF CIP SUCCESS

Based on the information, analysis, and discussion that have been presented in sections I–IX of this unit review, summarize the strengths and weaknesses of the unit. Describe specific actions the unit intends to take to capitalize on the strengths, mitigate the weaknesses, and improve unit outcomes and competencies. Provide the rationale for the expected outcomes chosen for the CIP(s).

Based on the information provided in this program review, the unit's strengths include the ability to offer a variety of academic assistance services from degreed professionals, including tutoring in various subjects. The unit provides valuable services to Collin College students, faculty, staff, and community members that include study space, computers, printing, course textbooks, study guides, flashcards, graphing calculators, microscopes, science models, workshops, semester events, final exam review sessions, embedded tutoring, orientations, and group, one-on-one, and walk-in tutoring appointments, offered both online and in person, to help students with their coursework and with projects outside of coursework, including test preparation and job application materials. In addition to math, writing, and science, tutoring appointments are also offered in a few other subjects as well, including reading comprehension, Spanish, accounting, economics, government, criminal justice, history, and drama. The unit also has specialized FAST (Foundational Academic Success Tutoring) tutors to assist students in developmental math and INRW courses. Tutoring in this variety of subjects is made possible both by APCAA tutors and with the help of faculty volunteers.

Another strength of the unit is its involvement and communication with stakeholders, both within Collin College and as part of the larger Collin community. The unit continuously works to extend knowledge of its available services directly to students in their classes through class visits and orientations, and targeted workshops based on faculty requests. APCAA managers present information about the unit's services during discipline meetings, homeschool orientations, full-time English faculty meetings, campus Dean's meetings, and adjunct faculty meetings, host information tables at faculty development conferences, make presentations at New Faculty Academies, and serve on faculty committees. The unit networks with other Collin College departments and offices frequently, including the incorporation of library workshops into APCAA workshop series, providing training on APCAA services to new college and career counselors, or APCAA staff receiving training on how best to serve students in the age of AI from the Dean of Students office. The unit extends its reach into the community as well, through hosting tables for campus Open Houses, networking with city libraries for events such as NaNoWriMo, and offering a summer camp for community members.

Another key strength of the unit that emerged during this last CIP cycle is the streamlining of the many services it offers to students. Despite more than doubling the number of campus APCAAs since the unit's last program review, the unit has built a framework of cross-campus collaboration to ensure the best delivery of services possible for students. This framework includes monthly manager meetings where managers can brainstorm solutions to problems that have arisen each month and work cooperatively towards accomplishing CIP goals. This collaboration has resulted in the creation and maintenance of a central APCAA webpage on the Collin website where information from all campuses is centralized for students, the creation of an

APCAA Canvas course that made information about the unit's services more readily available to iCollin virtual students and is now open to all Collin College students, and the unit's selection of the TracCloud scheduling platform. This platform adoption and implementation was the result of the unit's collaboration across the District to create a central scheduling dashboard for all students, a setup that ensures similar scheduling and kiosk sign in and out procedures for all students, regardless of which campus they visit, and has resulted in a collaborative effort to create one centralized online tutoring schedule for the District. The unit's collaboration to implement TracCloud has strengthened its ability to streamline service delivery to students, and through the implementation of the SurveyTrac feature of TracCloud, has remedied the need brought forward in the previous program review for an assessment tool that allowed the unit to be evaluated collectively as a group.

The unit has also identified areas of weakness. Many changes during the last four years, including doubling the number of campus APCAAs, the adoption of a scheduling platform that centralized District online tutoring, and the growing demand for online tutoring appointments, in part driven by a pandemic, dual credit growth, and the creation of the iCollin Virtual Campus, have resulted in moving forward with an online tutoring setup out of necessity and urgency to meet immediate demand. However, since that initial setup, staffing has become insufficient to meet the growing online tutoring demands. Since the online tutoring schedule is currently staffed by tutors who also work on campus, at times, a choice has to be made between staffing the on-campus tutoring schedules sufficiently or staffing the online tutoring schedules sufficiently. The unit's online tutoring setup should be improved to ensure this service can adequately meet student demand. Additionally, although improvements have been made this last CIP cycle to create the APCAA webpage and Canvas course, there is also room for improvement in how the unit markets its services, especially to students working online.

With this in mind, the unit has identified two outcomes for the next CIP cycle:

1. Managers will create a proposal based on gathered data that will recommend an appropriate level of online staffing and management that would lead to greater online appointment availability.
2. Improve and streamline distribution of information about Districtwide APCAA services to all students, especially those in dual credit and online courses.

Through this first outcome, the unit aims to capitalize on its momentum of collaboration and streamlining services to students to help mitigate issues that have arisen with the online tutoring schedule. By taking a critical look at the current process of staffing and managing the online tutoring schedule and analyzing the strengths and weaknesses of the current approach, the unit will have a clearer idea of the changes that need to be made to enhance delivery of this service to students. This analysis will help the unit identify and articulate a plan for moving forward with current and/or additional staff to improve this competency. Through the completion of this outcome, the unit hopes to become better equipped to meet the growing demand for online tutoring appointments.

Through the second outcome, the unit again aims to capitalize on its strength of cross-campus collaboration and streamlining of information. To ensure students accessing APCAA information online receive the same information as a student in a classroom, the unit seeks to create a promotional video that would accomplish what a class visit or orientation would accomplish and provide students working online with an overview of District APCAA services available to them. In addition to the creation of this video, the unit also seeks to encourage faculty to post the video orientation in their Canvas courses. By accomplishing this outcome, the unit intends to more clearly communicate its vast array of services to all students when they access APCAA information online.

XI. NEW CIP TABLES

Within the context of the information gleaned in this review process and any other relevant data, identify unit priorities for the next two years, including at least one unit outcome or competency, and focus on these priorities to formulate the unit's new CIP. The unit may also add short-term administrative, technological, assessment, resource, or professional development outcomes as needed.

A. **Complete the CIP Outcomes, Measures & Targets Table. Choose 1 to 2 outcomes from the table to focus on over the next two years.**

   Upload the completed CIP Outcomes, Measures & Targets Table in section XI.A. of the Appendix.

   In addition, e-mail the completed CIP Outcomes, Measures & Targets Table to the Institutional Research Office (IRO) at effectiveness@collin.edu.

B. **Complete boxes A, B, C, and D of the CIP Outcomes 1 & 2 Table.**

   Upload the completed CIP Outcomes 1 & 2 Table in section XI.B. of the Appendix.

   In addition, e-mail the completed CIP Outcomes, Measures & Targets Table to the Institutional Research Office (IRO) at effectiveness@collin.edu.