

Summary Report
Employer Satisfaction Survey of Workforce Education Programs
Spring 2016 Administration

Prepared by
Nasreen Ahmad
Director, Institutional Research-Policy Planning
Collin College

December 16, 2016

Summary Report Employer Satisfaction Survey of Workforce Education Programs Spring 2016 Administration

Executive Summary

The objective of the periodic Employer Satisfaction surveys administered by Collin Colleges' Institutional Research Office (IRO) is to assess the degree of satisfaction employers have with Collin's recent graduates who entered the workforce and to give program faculty a sense of how effectively they are preparing students to meet the current needs of employers. The insights provided should help Collin make better decisions about the training needs of employers and the preparation of Collin students for the 21st century employment market. Employer feedback becomes even more crucial in the context of Collin's Vision 2020 and the State of Texas' 60X30TX strategic plan, both of which emphasize workforce education. The latest survey was administered in spring 2016.

The survey asked those employers who had hired Collin graduates, to respond to ten prompts for assessing specific aspects of Collin graduates' preparation for the respective positions for which they were hired. An eleventh item is the overall assessment of how successfully Collin is preparing its students for the workforce. The prompts were assessed on a four-point scale¹ where 1 = strongly disagree and 4 = strongly agree. **Higher scores reflect higher satisfaction; a value closer to four is desirable.**

In 2016, it was suggested that some employers may have employed graduates with a general AA/AS from Collin. Therefore, Associate Degrees were added to the survey's list of occupational areas offered by Collin. The most commonly cited occupational areas represented by the survey responses were Associate Degree (12), Business Management (10), Hotel Restaurant Management (7), Child Development (6), Computer-Aided Drafting and Design (5), Dental Hygiene (5), Nursing (5) and Respiratory Care (5). Out of the 47 programs listed on the instrument, 11 received no responses.

Employers were largely satisfied with the performance of Collin graduates in all areas as indicated by mean scores greater than three for all prompts. The statements with which respondents most strongly agreed were that "Collin graduates appreciate diversity in the workplace" (3.67) and "Collin graduates demonstrate computer skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired" (3.61). These were closely followed by

¹ In previous administrations, reverse 4-point scale was used where 1 = strongly agree and 4 = strongly disagree, hence lower mean scores indicated a greater degree of relative satisfaction. The scale for 2016 was flipped to make it more intuitive so that higher values reflect higher satisfaction levels.

effective cooperation with others (3.55), and demonstrated ability to effectively participate in team activities (3.55). Overall, there was universal agreement (97 percent) among employers/companies that Collin successfully prepares its graduates for the workplace.

Compared to the results of the 2015 administration, the employers' mean satisfaction improved for four items: computer skills, diversity in workplace, effective cooperation with others, and oral communication skills. The most improvement occurred in computer skills followed by diversity in the workplace. The remaining items indicated slight declines in the employers' perceptions of Collin graduates as employees. The area showing the largest decline in its mean score was for critical thinking skills. There is a slight decline in the overall perception that Collin is preparing its students well (from 3.56 in 2015 to 3.51 in 2016); still the mean is closer to "4" ("strongly agree") on the scale. When comparing the results of 2016 and 2015 administrations, it should be borne in mind that the 2015 survey was administered only to the programs' advisory board members; whereas, the 2016 survey was administered to all employers including those on the programs' advisory boards. Qualitative analysis of open-ended comments indicated that almost one-third of the comments were positive, 30 percent were suggestions and 23 percent were areas of improvement. Only a handful of the comments were negative.

Like the previous administrations, a major shortcoming of this survey is that the number of responses returned are not large enough to permit analysis at the program level, thus limiting the usefulness of the survey for specific program improvement. The key challenge is identifying more of the businesses and agencies that employ Collin's graduates and collecting the contact information for specific individuals at those businesses and agencies. Compared to previous years, on one hand, there was greater engagement of workforce education faculty and academic administrators in identifying employers of graduates and their contact information. On the other hand, some faculty/academic administrators did not return the paper surveys they had requested for distribution; and it is likely that some neglected to dispense the survey's URL to their advisory board members.

In order to obtain employer information, numerous outside-the-box strategies were incorporated that included (1) expanding the survey modalities for advisory board members and giving more latitude to deans/directors in terms of survey administration; (2) seeking program directors' cooperation in embedding the Employer Satisfaction survey in their Programs' annual graduate surveys; (3) customizing the emails and letters for the advisory board members to bear the names of deans/directors; (4) soliciting the email addresses from employers responding to the paper surveys; (5) inserting paper surveys into the packets of registered employers at the Colleges' Annual job fair; and (6) initiating a databank of all employers that had ever hired Collin graduates.

Future efforts to identify employers and improve response

- Since some Collin's workforce programs conduct their own employer satisfaction surveys, henceforth, explore the possibility of adding questions from the Employer Satisfaction Survey to the Program's survey of graduates.
- Provide the survey recipients the option to complete the survey on mobile devices.
- Find a way to have graduates confirm/verify their most current personal email address prior to graduation.
- Administer paper surveys or make telephone calls to employers for whom only physical addresses or telephone numbers are garnered via "Graduate Survey."
- Work with Collin's CO-op to come up with efficient ways to collect employers' email addresses.
- Develop and maintain the IRO generated databank of employers' contact information.
- Explore less traditional methods of obtaining the employer' contact information.
- Emphasize the significance of the Employer Satisfaction survey to all stakeholders in the context of Collin's strategic plan, the Vision 2020, and the State of Texas' plan, 60X30TX, both of which emphasize workforce programs.

In conjunction with the numerous efforts listed above, active engagement and support of faculty and academic administrators will continue to be critical for the future success of the Employer Satisfaction Survey. The recent reorganization and changes at Collin would necessitate that IRO get in touch with the current personal and make efforts to get them involved. The associate deans/program directors/ not only can play a pivotal role in identifying employers of the workforce program graduates, they also can fill the irreplaceable function of contacting the employers thus helping Collin meet its obligations for program improvement and demonstrating to the State and the Southern Association of Schools and Colleges (SACS) the College's commitment to program improvement.

Summary Report

Employer Satisfaction Survey of Workforce Education Programs

Spring 2016 Administration

Introduction

Collin College's Institutional Research Office (IRO) administers a periodic Employer Satisfaction Survey to businesses and agencies that hire the College's workforce education program graduates. The purpose of this survey is to assess the degree of satisfaction employers have with Collin's recent workforce education program graduates, and to give program faculty a sense of how effectively they are preparing students to meet the current needs of the employers. The insights provided should help faculty and academic administrators make better decisions about the training needs of employers and the preparation of students for the 21st century employment market. The data generated also serve as useful input for instructional program review as well as state and SACS COC reporting. Outcomes of Employers Satisfaction Survey will be more critical in the context of Collin's upcoming strategic plan, the Vision 2020, and the State of Texas' 60X30 Plan, both of which emphasize workforce education. The most recent survey was administered in spring 2016, the data collection continued till the end of June and some programs were being followed as late as September to provide the completed surveys.

In early 2016 spring, IRO requested the deans of workforce programs to review the questionnaire and to ensure proper listing of programs in their areas. Suggested changes to the list of majors were incorporated in both the electronic and paper modalities of the instrument². Since some employers may have employed graduates that had a general AA/AS from Collin, therefore, in 2016, Associate Degree was added to the survey's listed occupational areas offered by Collin. Basically, the instrument remained the same with few tweaks such as, in 2016, the scale was inverted so that 1= strongly disagree and 4 = strongly agree in contrast to the previous administrations which used a reverse 4-point scale (1 = strongly agree and 4 = strongly disagree). This was done to make the scale more intuitive in that higher values reflect greater satisfaction.

Basically, the survey requests employers to check, from a list of Collin's workforce education majors, those majors from which they had hired Collin graduates over the past

² After consultation with the deans, the following changes were made to the program listing that respondents use to identify which graduates they hire.

- Removed the Alternative Teacher Certification Program
- Besides the workforce majors, an Associate Degree was added as an option to the list of occupational areas.

year. They are then asked to give their impressions of Collin graduates based on eleven prompts that relate to various areas of workforce preparation. The eleven prompts are rated on the afore mentioned four-point scale. A copy of the entire survey appears in Appendix B.

Methodology

The survey instrument itself and its administration processes were reviewed and revised. In order to improve the response rate, rather than communicating with deans only, some program directors/coordinators were also contacted to help facilitate IR's efforts to reach the employers of their program's graduates. A multi-pronged methodology was adopted that involved a number of survey modalities to obtain information about the employers of Collin's workforce graduates:

- A. Availability of survey modalities was expanded for the advisory boards and more leeway was given to deans in terms of survey administration options and survey modalities.
 - Deans/directors were given the choice to provide the email addresses of their advisory board members to IRO to administer the survey bearing their names. IRO administered the survey to a number of program's advisory boards whose deans/program directors provided IRO with their advisory board members' email addresses.
 - Deans/directors could dispense the survey directly to their advisory board members. The survey URL was provided to those deans/directors who chose to send the survey link directly to their advisory board members or any other employers of which they knew. IR provided them template cover letters so they could customize the letters with their names and sent out the survey link directly.
 - Paper surveys were made available to those deans/directors who wanted to dispense the paper surveys to at their advisory board meetings. If any advisory board member had directly hired a Collin College graduate, that person could respond to the survey on the spot and return it to the appropriate dean/director after the meeting. If advisory committee members had no firsthand experience with a Collin graduate, they were requested to pass the surveys on to their company's/agency's HR office or to the appropriate supervisor(s). In the last administration, IRO staff went to the various advisory board meetings, however, in 2016, the deans/directors

seemed more intent in giving out the survey to their advisory board members. On the positive side, it is a sign of engagement, however, on the flip side, some deans either did not collect the completed surveys or forgot to return them to IRO.

- B. For the advisory boards, the surveys were customized to bear the names of deans/directors. In the email sender's box, the name of the dean/director appeared along with his/her designation. This was done to encourage recipients to open their emails; if recipients recognize the senders' names they are more likely to open the email and less likely to treat it as spam. This initiative involved substantial effort and time on the part of the IRO staff member administering the survey as it entailed having multiple copies of the Employer Satisfaction Survey going out bearing names of different deans/directors which meant treating each Program's survey as a separate entity.
- C. The program directors and coordinators were also involved. Enlisting their help was successful and we got more buy-in from them.
 - o As a pilot, the Dental Hygiene Program Director cooperated and collaborated with IRO so that in addition to evaluating the performance of dental hygiene graduates' in relation to the responsibilities delegated by the State of Texas, questions from the Employer Satisfaction Survey were added to the Dental Hygiene survey. Instead of sending two separate surveys to employers, only one survey was sent. This saved time and effort in survey administration besides reducing survey fatigue for the employers. Next year, IRO will explore the possibility of such collaboration with other programs.
 - o The Respiratory Program Director has volunteered to take the paper surveys to those hospitals where Collin students perform clinicals, and who, the director knows, have hired Program graduates.
 - o A few other program directors have shown interest in next survey administration.
- D. The AY2014-2015 graduates were directly contacted via an electronic survey, the "Graduate Survey," to seek information about their employment status following graduation and their employers' electronic and physical addresses. The graduates were informed about the importance of the Employer Satisfaction survey, and assured that the questions did not relate to them directly rather they were general questions about all graduates. As a preemptive effort to address any concerns the graduates may have and to satisfy their curiosity in terms of what questions Collin

would be asking their employers a link to the “Employer Satisfaction Survey” was embedded into the Graduate Survey, so that graduates could click on the link to visit the survey for themselves. In prior years, permission was sought from the employed graduates to contact their employers. This was discontinued in 2016 in line with a suggestion following a meeting with deans and VP’s in 2014. In 2016, a total of 155 graduates responded to the survey but only 37 furnished the email addresses of their employers, (after removing duplicates and cleaning the data, the number of employers with email addresses was reduced to 28). Nonetheless, most graduates provided physical addresses and/or telephone numbers of their employers. Although, it entailed substantial work for IRO staff, still it was decided to administer paper surveys to those employers for whom IRO had obtained physical addresses and to call those employers for whom it procured phone numbers only. However, it could not be accomplished because of some unexpected constraints experienced by the project manager. In future, in addition to electronic administration, IRO plans to administer paper surveys to those employers for whom it garners only physical addresses and make phone calls to those employers for whom it obtains telephone numbers only.

E. IRO Director recruited the Career Services Director’s participation and Career Services included 92 paper surveys in the packets for the registered employers’ who participated in the Collin’s Annual Job Fair in April 2016 at Spring Creek campus. The intent of this effort was to obtain on-the-spot feedback from any employers who had hired last year. For the 2016 administration, seven completed surveys were returned. Despite the low response, IRO will pursue this initiative in next administrations; this initiative represents low-hanging fruit which should be collected. Hopefully, future efforts to inform and educate the employers, ahead of time, about the importance of the survey may bolster better outcomes.

F. The survey was tweaked:

- In 2016, for the first time, email addresses were solicited from employers. In previous administrations, only the employers’ names, their organizations’ names, physical addresses and phone numbers were sought. This revision will help strengthen and build the employer database being generated by IRO.
- The scale for the 11 questions was revised so that 1 = strongly disagree and 4 = strongly agree. In the past, the 11 prompts had a reverse scale. This change would make it easier to understand the response choices as well as improve clarity in the presentation of survey results as higher the value, higher the satisfaction.

- G. The IRO director initiated building a comprehensive databank of electronic and physical contact information of all employers who ever hired a Collin graduate to mitigate the difficulty and time consuming struggle in obtaining employer's contact information. The data were obtained from Symplicity³ (a job posting database used by Collin, that had the names of all employers who had ever hired/or listed job postings), and from past graduate and employer satisfaction surveys. The data had a lot of redundancies that were manually cleaned. After consolidating all the addresses from various sources and removing duplicates, the most current addresses were retained. A total of 9,061 addresses were garnered from various means. Despite substantial efforts to clean the data, when the survey was sent to 9,061 employers, 4,024 email addresses failed. Still it is encouraging that more than half of the email addresses were valid and almost three-fourth of the responses were yielded from database respondents. The number of responses in 2016 were 151 as opposed to 62 for 2015 and 135 for 2013. Compared to previous administrations, the number of completed responses is better since the 2016 survey asked employers if they had hired within the last year, whereas, the 2015 and 2013 surveys asked if they had hired within last two and three years respectively⁴. The data will be continuously revised to maintain the most updated employers contact information. Hopefully, in due time, this initiative will turn into a valuable resource for identifying recipients of Employer Satisfaction Survey.
- H. We did not get data from Collin's Cooperative Work Experience (Co-op) this year because it was too short-staffed to manually go through paper records for employers contact information. One drawback of Co-op data is that Co-op does not collect email addresses. In the past, we could use the Co-op data, but IRO has moved away from paper surveys. IRO plans on working with Co-op to come up with more efficient ways of data collection, particularly email addresses.
- I. IRO could not maintain consistency in sending follow up reminders that varied from survey to survey. No follow up reminders were sent in instances where the survey link was provided to the deans/program directors. In cases where IRO administered the survey, typically one follow-up reminder was sent. In case of paper surveys, no reminders were sent. While we got 155 responses, we do not

³ A new job search database that Collin's Career Services has started using since January 2015.

⁴ The variations in the reference period are because of gaps in survey administrations. No survey was administered in 2014, because IRO wanted to focus on those programs only which were undergoing program review. Despite IRO's effort, the survey administration did not materialize; therefore, the 2015 survey referred to two-years. The 2013 survey refers to three years because no surveys could be administered in 2010, 2011 and 2012 because of administrative changes within IRO and the considerable time it took to revise of the instrument by getting all deans on board.

know how many actual surveys were disseminated thus making it hard to calculate the response rate.

Results

Of the total employers who responded to the 2016 Employer Satisfaction Survey, 39 percent had employed Collin's graduates, and 9 percent had sent their employees to Collin for training purposes. Around 54 percent of the employers had not hired any graduate from Collin (see Appendix A, Table 2). The employers who had hired were asked to give the approximate number of graduates they had hired. Twenty percent reported hiring less than or equal to five graduates. A vast majority (77 percent) left this item blank. (Appendix A, Table 3).

The employers who had hired Collin's graduates were asked to respond. The prompts and the mean responses to assess specific aspects of graduates' workforce preparation are provided in Table 1. (See Appendix B for a copy of the questionnaire). The mean represents the arithmetic average of all scores on a given item, and the standard deviation reflects an average measure of variation from the mean. **The higher the mean response the greater is the relative degree of satisfaction.**

Employers were largely satisfied with the performance of Collin College's graduates in all areas as evidenced by mean scores above 3. The greatest degree of agreement was with the statement that "Collin graduates appreciate diversity in the workplace" (3.67) followed by "Collin graduates demonstrate computer skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired" (3.61). This was followed by "Collin graduates effectively cooperate with others" (3.55), "Collin graduates demonstrate the ability to effectively participate in team activities" (3.55) and "Overall, Collin is successfully preparing its graduates for the workplace" (3.51).

Compared to the results of the last survey (2015), mean satisfaction improved on four items: computer skills, diversity in workplace, effective cooperation with others, and oral communication skills. The most improvement occurred in the computer skills (11 percentage point increase) followed by graduates' appreciation of diversity in the workplace (5 percentage point increase). Seven out of remaining 11 prompts indicated slight declines in employers' perceptions of Collin graduates as employees. The area showing the most decline in the mean score was for "graduates demonstrate effective critical thinking skills" (3.59 in 2015 vs. 3.31 in 2016) followed by "graduates are technically competent for entry into the positions for which they are hired" (Appendix A, Table 5). While comparing the two surveys it should be borne in mind that the 2015 survey

went out to programs' advisory board members only, whereas, the 2016 survey went out to employers in addition to those on the programs' advisory boards

Overall, the employers perceived that Collin is preparing its students well (3.51) even though the mean score slid from 3.56 in 2015 to 3.51 in 2016. Still it is closer to "4" ("strongly agree") on the scale. The higher the value on the scale the better the impression of Collin graduates as employees. Overall, 97% of the employers "strongly agreed" or "agreed" that Collin was successfully preparing its graduates for the workplace (Appendix A, Table 4).

Table 1. Response Metrics for Employer Satisfaction Survey: 2016

Prompts	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
1. Collin graduates are technically competent for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.48	0.640
2. Collin graduates have oral communication skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.49	0.504
3. Collin graduates demonstrate writing skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.42	0.635
4. Collin graduates demonstrate ability to understand written information associated with the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.46	0.561
5. Collin graduates demonstrate computer skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	64	3.61	0.607
6. Collin graduates demonstrate effective critical thinking skills.	64	3.31	0.687
7. Collin graduates demonstrate the ability to effectively participate in team activities.	65	3.55	0.560
8. Collin graduates effectively participate in work-related problem solving.	63	3.40	0.661
9. Collin graduates effectively cooperate with others.	65	3.55	0.587
10. Collin graduates appreciate diversity in the workplace.	64	3.67	0.536
11. Overall, Collin is successfully preparing its graduates for the workplace.	65	3.51	0.616

The occupational areas most commonly represented by the respondents were Associates Degree (12), Business Management (10), Hotel Restaurant Management (7), Child Development (6), Computer-Aided Drafting and Design (5), Dental Hygiene (5), Nursing (5), and Respiratory Care (5). We did not get any responses for 11 programs. For details, see Appendix A, Table 1.

Despite concerted effort, there were insufficient number of responses from any area to allow data to be meaningfully broken out across the College's 48 programs listed on the survey. Thus, the results are presented only in an overall institutional summary.

A list of 126 companies/organizations that voluntarily identified themselves is provided in Table 2, below.

Table 2. Businesses/Agencies that Responded to 2016 Employer Satisfaction Survey

A1 Affordable Garage Door Services	Extruders/Wylie, Texas	Plano Community Homes
ABRA Therapeutics	Eye Care Avenue	Plans By Design
Academic Outfitters	Fairview Eyecare, P.A.	Preferred Care Partners Management Group
Academics Plus, L.C.	Farmers Insurance	Primrose School of Prosper
Advanced Fixtures, Inc.	Freeman-Millican, Inc.	Raytheon
Aimbridge Hospitality	Frisco School of Music and Performing Arts	RCS Enterprises, LP
AlphaBEST Education, Inc.	Frontline Source Group	Reading Ranch
Alphagraphics	Garland Power & Light	ResMed Corp
American Airlines	Global IP Networks	Rosewood Crescent
American National Bank of Texas	Green Gate Stables	Sanden International
Ameritex Guard Services	Habitat for Humanity ReStore	Save Water Co
Apple Creek Preschool	Half Associates Inc.	Service Autopilot
Aqua~Fit Swim & Fitness Family Wellness Center	Hampton Inn & Suites McKinney	Settlement Capital Corporation
Aramark	Heads Up Sprinkler Co, LLC	Smart Eyes
Bill Kukla Realty	Heartland	Smoothie Factory
Blue Mountain Equipment, Inc.	Hired hands, Inc.	Spain Internship
Boone Financial Services	Idea Grove	Spector chiropractic
Bounce For Fun	Injury Management Organization, Inc.	SSAF, LLC
Brio Tuscan Grille	International Association of Exhibitions and Events (IAEE)	StarDust Celebrations
Cardinals Sport Center	JC Penny	State Farm Insurance
Careington International	John Parker Insurance Agency, LLC	Stonebriar Medical Associates
Casteel & Associates, Inc.	Kid Mania	Stretch-n-Grow Fitness
Change Realty, LLC	Kids R Kids	Target
Children's Garden Montessori Academy	Kumon	Texadia Systems
Circuit Design Specialties, Inc.	Lenscrafters	Texas Health Presbyterian, Dallas
Cisco Systems	Lowe's Home Improvement	Texas Neurology Sleep Disorders Center
City of Lucas	Lyndsey Rhode State Farm	Texas Redbud Dental
CKW Commercial dba Blind Depot	Medical Center of McKinney	The Auto Shop
Cole Design Group	Medical Center of Plano	The Beck Group
College Nannies and Tutors	Medical City Dallas Hospital	The Goddard School
Collin College	Menchie's Frozen Yogurt	Thering & Associates, PLLC
Compliments LLC	MNK Infotech	TMCP
Credit Union of Texas	Neuropsychology Consultants PLLC	Transwestern
Dave and Busters	New York Life	United Through HOPE
DBI Engineers	North Texas Dental (Sherman, TX)	UPS McKinney
Dental Auxiliary	Northwest Bible Church	USDA-Farm Service Agency
Dental Care of Garland	NTTA	UTD Teacher Development Center
Dlynn Consulting	On the Border	Waddill Street Baptist Church
Dr.Meng-sheng Lin Acupuncture Center	Once Upon A Child	Wainwright Real Estate, Insurance and Financial Services
Earth Tech	Oncor Electric Delivery	Whispering Farms Montessori
Emerson Process Management Regulators Technologies	O'Neil Digital Solutions, LLC	Your Sales Leads, Inc.
ETAN Industries	Outback Steakhouse	
Executive Cleaners	Oxidor Laboratories	

Open-Ended Comments

Respondents were given an opportunity to provide comments regarding their experiences with Collin's graduates. Thirty-one comments were received which are summarized in the table 3a below. Most of the responses were positive (n=11); nine were suggestions, which are bolded; seven comments related to improvements, which are in blue font; and three comment were negative, which are in red font. Overall, almost one-third of the open-ended comments were positive and another 30 percent were suggestions and 23 percent were areas of improvement.

Table 3a: Summary Open-ended Comments

Comments	N
Positive responses	11
Suggestions	9
Needs Improvement	7
Negative	3
Neutral	1
Total comments	31

All the comments are presented verbatim in Table 3b, below.

Table 3b. Open-Ended Comments in Response to the Following Prompt: "Please provide comments or suggestion that might help Collin College more effectively prepare students to work in your organization."

Comments

Being a non-profit we would certainly appreciate sending volunteers from Marketing, Public Relations, Computers, Social Networking, Merchandising and more...we would be able to give them a testimonial and "hands on" experience in their area as the do "special projects". Habitat for Humanity ReStore Plano is moving locations and could use skilled College Educated Volunteers to help us.

Collin College does a better job of preparing their students for real world jobs. Continue focusing on providing your students with real world skills and experience. Collin College needs to focus more on working with local industry to place the students into internship programs.

For our purposes, Collin College does an excellent job.

I am the owner and Director of several Montessori Schools for past 13 years. I have hired and worked with many students who takes Collin college Montessori Teacher certificate courses as interns and as graduates. The students seem to become strong only after many years additional training in Montessori philosophy and pedagogy. Which is due to lack of emphasis of the same during training period. The internship period is very 'unguided' so many interns struggle and are not confident to become lead teachers of a Montessori classroom. They prefer to be assistant teachers or co teachers for several years before they pursue a lead position. They need a lot of guidance and supervision during their internship period so they develop confidence and resourceful. They need unannounced visits to the classrooms they are interns and must be evaluated of their classroom management, professional conduct, confidence level, practice of the core Montessori principles and made sure they are working with the 3- 6 years old students during the morning Montessori work cycle under a certified/experienced guides.

I have only come across one graduate of Collin College and she is amazing. She was hired directly into an SE role at Cisco Systems right out of the ASE program. That is a feat on its own as it is very hard to get into Cisco. She also participates in the Collin College Computer Networking Advisory Board.

I think that Collin needs to do a better job of teaching professionalism. This starts in the classroom. For example, when the students are giving a presentation, they should not be wearing their daisy may short shorts, or their gym clothes. As a student at Collin and a potential employer this shows a lack of judgement on the part of the students and makes me think twice about hiring. This is particularly evident in the CDEC and TECA classes.

I wish Collin College offered coronal polishing and sealant courses for dental assistants to become certified in these procedures. It could be taught in the dental hygiene clinic on a Saturday. As it stands, I have to send my assistants to Grayson College for these one-day courses.

I would like to see more emphasis put on critical thinking. The hands-on is great for helping students contribute immediately, but critical thinking skills will help them advance more quickly in their careers and will help the employers with much needed individual contributors that are able to thrive without significant "hand holding"

I would suggest more hands on, real world scenarios to prepare them for the workplace.

If I could suggest any additional training, it would be familiarity with types of insurance/dental benefits.

Table 3b. Continued

Comments
In the surgical technology field, making sure that students get more in class training on all basic surgical cases, making sure that every area is covered for common procedures, which will allow students to expand their knowledge in more specialty areas as they move along.
My employees have to go out on their own and teach fitness classes. They have to be self-motivated and very reliable. There have only been a few cases where the coaches were not very reliable from Collin College. They do need to work on social skills with speaking to others and problem solving. They just need to treat it like it's their business and take pride in what they do.
Never hired any Collin College grads/students
Partner better with employers. We have reached out attempting to hire more from your school but the follow up responses have been pathetic - almost non-existent. People that we have hired from Collin College have come to us and applied directly - not with any real support from your school. It would go a long way in the community if you made employer partnerships more cooperative.
Partnering with companies to offer college credit for work experience
Promote being self-driven to perform tasks or projects
Respiratory Care is doing an excellent job preparing candidates. I would like to see Collin's Respiratory Care Program transition to a Bachelors program. The AARC is recommending our profession use BS as the entry level for future therapists.
Somehow, instill a work ethic, the idea that you get ahead by what you know, but also, or more so, how hard you work and how you think ahead.
Thanks for the support.
The person who came from Collin College was a drug user and wasn't competent in any manner for us and we were extremely disappointed. He didn't last more than a couple of weeks.
The students need to work on real life projects
They may have done well in school - but that does not mean that they know it all. Completing an educational program is preparation to BEGIN a career. New employees should start a new position with an attitude of continuing to learn about their chosen field. New employees are not experts with vast amounts of practical experience and should not expect to be paid like one. That's why the positions are called "Entry Level" and growth does not happen in the space of 2 or 3 months.
We have always enjoyed recruiting on Collin College campuses.
We have found over the years the Collin graduates consistently meet and/or exceed our expectations which is not true for other local Respiratory programs.
We have hired two or three legal assistants from Collin College and none have been effective in the work place. They all had above average GPAs, but it appears they were not prepared to take what they had learned and actually put it to use. We had to let all of them go before their 90 day probationary period ended.

Table 3b. Continued

Comments

We have two interpreters who graduated from the program. One graduated 6 years ago and the other one graduated 18+ years ago. The program has undergone quite a bit of change since that time. The field of interpreting has also evolved as the community needs have changed. It has become increasingly difficult for 2 year programs to completely prepare students to graduate and be ready to enter the field right away. The students need to have exposure to Deaf leaders as well as Interpreters who well versed in interpreting (this does not always equate to years of experience) This is a profession that you must be willing to continue to hone your skills. You cannot graduate and think your learning experience is over. Students must have a strong work ethic while in school, take advantage of the training techniques they learn, and use that work ethic and training to further expand their skills after graduation.

We hired a first year Collin College student and the job was not related to his major - he wasn't sure what it would be. He was simply entering information into our new computer system to help in the initial startup - he did a great job. I would be more than happy to try hiring again from your school if another opportunity to do so comes up.

We love to work with the Co-op program

We mostly struggle with getting our employees to respond quickly and take responsibility for their job. We feel, occasionally our Collin College student/graduate employees have yet to understand the importance of their actions within the company.

We were able to hire one of your more outstanding students and have been very pleased. We were looking for someone with Civil 3D training which is more in tune with Civil Engineering. I understand not a lot of your students are focused in that area so we were fortunate to find someone that had that training.

Work ethic, seeing things from an employer's point of view, showing up on time all the time, going above and beyond to make yourself indispensable in your work position, smiling and creating excellence in the customer service arena, never using cell phone when on the clock, reporting any issues to your boss that you are aware of that may cause an issue down the road so boss can intercede.

Challenges

A major challenge of this survey is its persistently low response rate. Despite the fact that we had a much higher number of completed surveys in 2016, the number of responses are not adequate enough to make it possible to generalize the data at the program level, thus limiting the usefulness of the survey results.

Because of the multiple survey modalities and variations in the administration process, IRO could not maintain consistency in sending follow up reminders, which varied between administrations of the surveys, e.g., no follow-up reminders were sent in case of paper surveys and in cases where the survey URL was provided to the deans/program directors. Typically, one follow-up reminder was sent in instances where IRO administered the surveys directly.

IRO could not keep track of the number of advisory board members to whom the survey link was provided by the deans/program directors, and how many paper surveys were distributed to members in the advisory board meetings by dean/directors as different advisory boards met at different times. Hence, it was not possible to calculate a response rate for the survey.

Future efforts to identify employers and improve response

- Since some workforce programs conduct their own employer surveys, IRO intends to explore the possibility of adding questions from the Employer Satisfaction survey to those Programs' surveys.
- Provide an option to complete the Employer Satisfaction survey on mobile devices.
- Find a way to have graduates confirm/provide their personal email addresses prior to graduation so that they could be contacted with minimum bounce offs. In 2016, 195 of 2,707 emails sent to graduates bounced back.
- Continue to solicit employer information via "Graduate Survey" and administer paper surveys to employers for whom it garners physical addresses only, and to make telephone calls to employers for whom it obtained telephone numbers only.
- Work with Collin's Co-op to come up with more efficient ways of data collection, particularly email addresses.
- Continue to develop and maintain the IRO generated database of employers.

- Explore less traditional methods⁶ of obtaining employer information which yields inconsistent and low outcomes.
 - The recent Outcomes Survey launched by GradLeaders to track graduates' career outcomes for recent graduates will be explored. This survey is being utilized by 120 schools nationwide and provides insights into how graduates fare after commencement, and at three, six and 12 months after finishing their studies.. In addition to detailed reports and data, the Outcomes Survey's institutional clients receive anonymized aggregate national reports at six and 12 month's post-graduation for use along with a comparison of their graduates to the national aggregate.
 - With the Gainful Employment Regulation going into effect, Equifax has leveraged its existing job verification (The Work Number) with data from over 5,700 employers and provides a dynamic picture of graduates over time by program and degree type. The data may be more accurate, because there is no self-reporting. Graduates' outcomes analysis provides information about where the graduates reside post-graduation, their income, and which industries employ the institutions' graduates.
- Emphasize the significance of the Employer Satisfaction survey to the deans/directors, employers, and graduates in the context of Collin's strategic plan, Vision 2020, and the State of Texas' plan, 60X30TX, both of which emphasize workforce education.

Summary

Collin College's 2016 Employer Satisfaction Survey indicated that employers were largely satisfied with the preparation of Collin College graduates for the workplace. Employers from a broad range of occupational areas showed consistently high levels of satisfaction with the performance of Collin's graduates. IRO received a much higher number of completed surveys in 2016. Still, we need larger numbers of employers to respond so that we have some confidence that the survey results represent all employers of Collin graduates. It would also be desirable to obtain sufficient responses to be able to generalize to individual programs. The open-ended comments have mostly been positive. Multiple approaches and modalities have been deployed to help improve the response rates. Besides pursuing with the current successful strategies, some new

⁶ IRO has explored (1) HEPdata's Employer Alert, a match donor company that tracks alumni employment changes using social media. It could only provide the contact addresses of the Human Resource offices of the companies. This was deemed as not very helpful, and therefore not pursued. (2) The Chumura Analytics JobsEq, a software company that provides current labor and wage data by industry and educational CIP codes, too could not provide employers' email addresses.

initiatives will be undertaken, such as, making the survey available via mobile devices, exploring the Outcomes Survey by GradLeaders.com and TheWorkNumber by Equifax.

APPENDICES

Appendix A
Summary Tables

Table A1: List of Programs by Response (in descending order of number of response)

Programs from which responses received			Programs from which responses not received		
	Count	%		Count	%
Associates Degree (none of the listed majors)	12	7.9%	Audio Engineering	0	0.0%
Business Management	10	6.6%	Biotechnology	0	0.0%
Hotel Restaurant Management	7	4.6%	Convergence Technology	0	0.0%
Child Development	6	4.0%	Database Programming	0	0.0%
Computer-Aided Drafting and Design	5	3.3%	E-Business Development	0	0.0%
Dental Hygiene	5	3.3%	Electronic Technology	0	0.0%
Nursing	5	3.3%	Emergency Medical Services	0	0.0%
Respiratory Care	5	3.3%	Pastry Arts	0	0.0%
Computer Information Systems	4	2.6%	Semiconductor Manufacturing	0	0.0%
Computer Networking	4	2.6%	Software Design	0	0.0%
Graphic Design	4	2.6%	Web Administration	0	0.0%
Computer Science	3	2.0%			
Law Enforcement	3	2.0%			
Sign Language Interpreter	3	2.0%			
Animation/Game Art	2	1.3%			
Commercial Music	2	1.3%			
Culinary Arts	2	1.3%			
Health Information Management	2	1.3%			
Marketing	2	1.3%			
Meeting and Event Management	2	1.3%			
Paralegal/Legal Assistant	2	1.3%			
Real Estate	2	1.3%			
Surgical Technology	2	1.3%			
Telecommunications	2	1.3%			
Certified Nurse Assistant	1	0.7%			
Cybersecurity	1	0.7%			
Dietary Manager	1	0.7%			
Engineering Technology	1	0.7%			
Fire Science	1	0.7%			
Geospatial Information Science	1	0.7%			
Information Systems Cybersecurity	1	0.7%			
Interior Design	1	0.7%			
Office Systems Support	1	0.7%			
Photography	1	0.7%			
Polysomnography (Sleep Technology)	1	0.7%			
Web Developer	1	0.7%			

Table A2. Has Your Organization Employed any Collin College Graduates Within the Last Year (2015)?

	Count	%
My organization has employed Collin graduates	59	39.1%
My organization has sent employees for training/upgrading their skills by taking courses at Collin College	13	8.6%
My organization has not employed any Collin graduates	81	53.6%
Total*	151	100.0%

* Does not add to 151 because some respondents selected multiple response choices.

Table A3. How Many Collin Graduates Have you Employed in the Last Year (2015)?

	Count	%
Less than or equal to 5	30	19.9
6-10	1	0.7
More than 10	2	1.3
Many*	1	0.7
n/a	1	0.7
No response	116	76.8
Grand Total	151	100.0

*The respondent did not give a number, rather said "many," which can fall between "6-10" or "More than10," categories. The "many" is kept as a separate category for comparative purposes with prior administrations where the number of respondents saying "many" was greater.

Table A4. Overall, Collin is Successfully Preparing Its Graduates for the Workplace

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
1=Strongly Disagree	1	0.7	1.5	1.5
2	1	0.7	1.5	3.1
3	27	17.9	41.5	44.6
4= Strongly Agree	36	23.8	55.4	100.0
Total	65	43.0	100.0	
No response	86	57.0		
Grand Total	151	100.0		

Table A5. Comparison of 2016 and 2015 Employer Satisfaction Survey Results
(1= strongly disagree; 4 = strongly agree)

Prompts	Spring 2016			Spring 2015*			% Increase in Mean Score 2016-2015
	N	Mean Score	Std. Deviation	N	Mean Score	Std. Deviation	
1. Collin graduates are technically competent for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.48	0.64	33	3.61	0.86	-3.6
2. Collin graduates have oral communication skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.49	0.50	34	3.47	0.86	0.6
3. Collin graduates demonstrate writing skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.42	0.63	34	3.44	0.82	-0.7
4. Collin graduates demonstrate ability to understand written information associated with the positions for which they are hired.	65	3.46	0.56	34	3.56	0.86	-2.7
5. Collin graduates demonstrate computer skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	64	3.61	0.61	34	3.26	0.96	10.6
6. Collin graduates demonstrate effective critical thinking skills.	64	3.31	0.69	34	3.59	0.78	-7.7
7. Collin graduates demonstrate the ability to effectively participate in team activities.	65	3.55	0.56	34	3.62	0.78	-1.8
8. Collin graduates effectively participate in work-related problem solving.	63	3.40	0.66	34	3.47	0.90	-2.1
9. Collin graduates effectively cooperate with others.	65	3.55	0.59	33	3.52	0.87	1.1
10. Collin graduates appreciate diversity in the workplace.	64	3.67	0.54	34	3.50	0.93	4.9
11. Overall, Collin is successfully preparing its graduates for the workplace.	65	3.51	0.62	34	3.56	0.86	-1.4

Source: Employer Satisfaction Survey Spring 2016 and 2015.

* In 2015, a reverse four-point scale was used where 1 = strongly agree and 4 = strongly disagree. In order to make comparisons with the 2016 survey, the scale of 2015 survey was flipped.

The red fill indicates a decline in the mean score for 2016 compared to 2015.
The green fill indicates an increase in the mean score for 2016 compared to 2015.

Appendix B
Employer Satisfaction Survey Questionnaire



Employer Satisfaction Survey

As an employer of Collin's graduates, your opinion is very important to us. The following survey will take no more than five minutes of your time. Your feedback will help us do a better job of preparing our students to meet your needs. Any information you provide will remain confidential.

Has your organization employed any Collin College graduates within the **last year (2015)**?

- My organization has employed Collin graduates
- My organization has sent employees for training/upgrading their skills by taking courses at Collin College
- My organization has not employed any Collin graduates

●○○○○○○○○○○

Reset Next

Powered by **snap**



Employer Satisfaction Survey

How many Collin graduates did you employ last year (2015)?

●●●●○○○○○○

Back Reset Restart Next

Powered by **snap**



Employer Satisfaction Survey

Your organization employed Collin graduates from which of the following majors in 2015.
(Please check all that apply)

- | | | |
|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Animation/Game Art | <input type="checkbox"/> Dietary Manager | <input type="checkbox"/> Office Systems Support |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Audio Engineering | <input type="checkbox"/> E-Business Development | <input type="checkbox"/> Pastry Arts |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Biotechnology | <input type="checkbox"/> Electronic Technology | <input type="checkbox"/> Paralegal/Legal Assistant |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Business Management | <input type="checkbox"/> Engineering Technology | <input type="checkbox"/> Photography |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Certified Nurse Assistant | <input type="checkbox"/> Emergency Medical Services | <input type="checkbox"/> Polysomnography (Sleep Technology) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Child Development | <input type="checkbox"/> Fire Science | <input type="checkbox"/> Real Estate |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Commercial Music | <input type="checkbox"/> Graphic Design | <input type="checkbox"/> Respiratory Care |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Computer Aided Drafting and Design | <input type="checkbox"/> Geospatial Information Science | <input type="checkbox"/> Semiconductor Manufacturing |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Computer Information Systems | <input type="checkbox"/> Health Information Management | <input type="checkbox"/> Sign Language Interpreter |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Computer Networking | <input type="checkbox"/> Hotel Restaurant Management | <input type="checkbox"/> Software Design |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Computer Science | <input type="checkbox"/> Information Systems Cybersecurity | <input type="checkbox"/> Surgical Technology |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Convergence Technology | <input type="checkbox"/> Interior Design | <input type="checkbox"/> Telecommunications |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Culinary Arts | <input type="checkbox"/> Law Enforcement | <input type="checkbox"/> Web Administration |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Cybersecurity | <input type="checkbox"/> Marketing | <input type="checkbox"/> Web Developer |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Database Programming | <input type="checkbox"/> Meeting and Event Management | <input type="checkbox"/> Associates Degree (none of the above majors) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Dental Hygiene | <input type="checkbox"/> Nursing | |

●●●●●●○○○○○

← Back Reset Restart Next →

Powered by **snapsurveys.com**



Employer Satisfaction Survey

Please rate your general impressions of Collin graduates as employees.

	1=Strongly Disagree	2	3	4= Strongly Agree
Collin graduates are technically competent for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates have oral communication skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates demonstrate writing skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates demonstrate ability to understand written information associated with the positions for which they are hired.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates demonstrate computer skills appropriate for entry into the positions for which they are hired.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates demonstrate effective critical thinking skills.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates demonstrate the ability to effectively participate in team activities.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates effectively participate in work-related problem solving.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates effectively cooperate with others.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Collin graduates appreciate diversity in the workplace.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Overall, Collin is successfully preparing its graduates for the workplace.	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

●●●●●●●●○○○

← Back
Reset
Restart
Next →

Powered by **snap**



Employer Satisfaction Survey

Please provide comments or suggestion that might help Collin College more effectively prepare students to work in your organization.

●●●●●●●●○○○

← Back
Reset
Restart
Next →

Powered by **snap**



Employer Satisfaction Survey

Please indicate:

Your Name:

Email Address:

Organization's Name:

Work Phone:

(xxx-xxx-xxxx)

Address:

If you are ready, please click on the red submit button to send your response.

Thank you for taking the time to complete this survey.

If you have any problems sending your response or if you have any questions about the survey please contact nahmad@collin.edu

Progress indicator: 11 dots, 10th dot filled

Navigation buttons: Back (blue left arrow), Reset (blue circle), Restart (blue circle), Submit (red right arrow)

Powered by **snap**